

**Third Session – Forty-First Legislature**  
of the  
**Legislative Assembly of Manitoba**  
**DEBATES**  
and  
**PROCEEDINGS**  
**Official Report**  
**(Hansard)**

*Published under the  
authority of  
The Honourable Myrna Driedger  
Speaker*

**MANITOBA LEGISLATIVE ASSEMBLY**  
**Forty-First Legislature**

| <b>Member</b>            | <b>Constituency</b>  | <b>Political Affiliation</b> |
|--------------------------|----------------------|------------------------------|
| ALLUM, James             | Fort Garry-Riverview | NDP                          |
| ALTEMEYER, Rob           | Wolseley             | NDP                          |
| BINDLE, Kelly            | Thompson             | PC                           |
| CLARKE, Eileen, Hon.     | Agassiz              | PC                           |
| COX, Cathy, Hon.         | River East           | PC                           |
| CULLEN, Cliff, Hon.      | Spruce Woods         | PC                           |
| CURRY, Nic               | Kildonan             | PC                           |
| DRIEDGER, Myrna, Hon.    | Charleswood          | PC                           |
| EICHLER, Ralph, Hon.     | Lakeside             | PC                           |
| EWASKO, Wayne            | Lac du Bonnet        | PC                           |
| FIELDING, Scott, Hon.    | Kirkfield Park       | PC                           |
| FLETCHER, Steven, Hon.   | Assiniboia           | Man.                         |
| FONTAINE, Nahanni        | St. Johns            | NDP                          |
| FRIESEN, Cameron, Hon.   | Morden-Winkler       | PC                           |
| GERRARD, Jon, Hon.       | River Heights        | Lib.                         |
| GOERTZEN, Kelvin, Hon.   | Steinbach            | PC                           |
| GRAYDON, Clifford        | Emerson              | Ind.                         |
| GUILLEMARD, Sarah        | Fort Richmond        | PC                           |
| HELWER, Reg              | Brandon West         | PC                           |
| ISLEIFSON, Len           | Brandon East         | PC                           |
| JOHNSON, Derek           | Interlake            | PC                           |
| JOHNSTON, Scott          | St. James            | PC                           |
| KINEW, Wab               | Fort Rouge           | NDP                          |
| KLASSEN, Judy            | Kewatinook           | Lib.                         |
| LAGASSÉ, Bob             | Dawson Trail         | PC                           |
| LAGIMODIERE, Alan        | Selkirk              | PC                           |
| LAMONT, Dougald          | St. Boniface         | Lib.                         |
| LAMOUREUX, Cindy         | Burrows              | Lib.                         |
| LATHLIN, Amanda          | The Pas              | NDP                          |
| LINDSEY, Tom             | Flin Flon            | NDP                          |
| MALOWAY, Jim             | Elmwood              | NDP                          |
| MARCELINO, Flor          | Logan                | NDP                          |
| MARCELINO, Ted           | Tyndall Park         | NDP                          |
| MARTIN, Shannon          | Morris               | PC                           |
| MAYER, Colleen, Hon.     | St. Vital            | PC                           |
| MICHALESKI, Brad         | Dauphin              | PC                           |
| MICKLEFIELD, Andrew      | Rossmere             | PC                           |
| MORLEY-LECOMTE, Janice   | Seine River          | PC                           |
| NESBITT, Greg            | Riding Mountain      | PC                           |
| PALLISTER, Brian, Hon.   | Fort Whyte           | PC                           |
| PEDERSEN, Blaine, Hon.   | Midland              | PC                           |
| PIWNIUK, Doyle           | Arthur-Virden        | PC                           |
| REYES, Jon               | St. Norbert          | PC                           |
| SARAN, Mohinder          | The Maples           | Ind.                         |
| SCHULER, Ron, Hon.       | St. Paul             | PC                           |
| SMITH, Andrew            | Southdale            | PC                           |
| SMITH, Bernadette        | Point Douglas        | NDP                          |
| SMOOK, Dennis            | La Verendrye         | PC                           |
| SQUIRES, Rochelle, Hon.  | Riel                 | PC                           |
| STEFANSON, Heather, Hon. | Tuxedo               | PC                           |
| SWAN, Andrew             | Minto                | NDP                          |
| TEITSMA, James           | Radisson             | PC                           |
| WHARTON, Jeff, Hon.      | Gimli                | PC                           |
| WIEBE, Matt              | Concordia            | NDP                          |
| WISHART, Ian             | Portage la Prairie   | PC                           |
| WOWCHUK, Rick            | Swan River           | PC                           |
| YAKIMOSKI, Blair         | Transcona            | PC                           |

## LEGISLATIVE ASSEMBLY OF MANITOBA

Wednesday, October 24, 2018

*The House met at 1:30 p.m.*

**Madam Speaker:** O Eternal and Almighty God, from Whom all power and wisdom come, we are assembled here before Thee to frame such laws as may tend to the welfare and prosperity of our province. Grant, O merciful God, we pray Thee, that we may desire only that which is in accordance with Thy will, that we may seek it with wisdom and know it with certainty and accomplish it perfectly for the glory and honour of Thy name and for the welfare of all our people. Amen.

Please be seated.

### ROUTINE PROCEEDINGS

**Madam Speaker:** Introduction of bills? Committee reports?

### TABLING OF REPORTS

**Madam Speaker:** I am pleased to table the annual report of the Legislative Assembly Management Commission for the year ending March 31st, 2018. Copies of the report have been placed on members' desks.

Ministerial statements?

### MEMBERS' STATEMENTS

#### Canadian Forces Operation UNIFIER

**Mr. Nic Curry (Kildonan):** I rise today to pay tribute to the continued work of our Canadian Armed Forces abroad. Canadian soldiers serve with distinction across the world and continue to do so in eastern Europe.

Operation UNIFIER is the Canadian Armed Forces mission to support security forces in Ukraine. The mission started in spring of 2015 with the deployment of approximately 200 Canadian Armed Forces members to Ukraine. To date, over 8,000 Ukrainian soldiers have received training from Canadian Armed Forces members. Canada has started to act in support for development, security, democracy, humanitarian aid and military training through Operation UNIFIER. This is an integral part of Canada's plan to support the government of Ukraine to remain sovereign, secure and stable.

Since 2014, the Russian government, led by Vladimir Putin, has infringed on the sovereignty of

Ukraine with the illegal annexation of Crimea and through military support of Russian separatists in the Donbass region of Ukraine. Thousands of Ukrainians have died in the fighting and well over 1 million people have been displaced from their homes. The brave men and women of the Canadian Armed Forces know that these threats to global security exist in Ukraine, and Operation UNIFIER is part of the international effort to support a free and independent Ukraine.

Madam Speaker, Canadian soldiers serve with no need of thanks, but that is what they earned from the Ukrainian community in Winnipeg. On October 14th the Ukrainian Canadian Congress Manitoba Provincial Council hosted an appreciation event for soldiers based in Manitoba who served on Operation UNIFIER in Ukraine. This event exceeded expectations with an attendance of over 300 community members, over 30 Canadian soldiers, all hosted at Holy Eucharist parish. I was joined by my colleagues, the Minister of Infrastructure (Mr. Schuler), the member for Rossmere (Mr. Micklefield), member for Transcona (Mr. Yakimoski), member for Burrows (Ms. Lamoureux) and military–Manitoba's military envoy, the member for St. Norbert (Mr. Reyes).

Thank you to the soldiers who served on Operation UNIFIER for supporting the free people of Ukraine. My deepest thanks to the UCC MPC for their appreciation and recognition of our veterans at this event with funds raised that will be donated in support of medical aid and humanitarian relief efforts in Ukraine.

Madam Speaker, please welcome members of the UCC MPC who are in the gallery with us today. Dyakuyu. Slava Ukraini.

Madam Speaker, I ask for leave to include the names of our guests from the UCC MPC in our Hansard.

**Madam Speaker:** Is there leave to include the names of the guests in Hansard? *[Agreed]*

*UCC MPC members: Joan Lewandowsky, president; Nataliya Boyko; Tetyana Chorny; Nick Krawetz; Khrystyna Lazar; Myroslava Pidhirnyj*

### Bear Clan Patrol

**Mrs. Bernadette Smith (Point Douglas):** Today, we are joined by members of the Bear Clan Patrol, an extraordinary, community-run collective. Volunteers who work in Winnipeg, Brandon and elsewhere in Canada help keeping our communities safer.

Alongside Bear Clan's mandate of safety supports, their efforts relatively extend to: finding missing people; providing front-line help and medical resources as well as referrals; distributing food donations; ridding the streets of discarded needles, other drug paraphernalia and drugs themselves; and, most importantly, establishing strong relationships with communities through outreach, mentoring and other vital services.

Bear Clan spends much of their volunteer patrol time scouring streets with flashlight-lit back alleys looking for used needles, discarded weapons and meth. Only last week, Bear Clan found nearly 6 grams of meth in a community garden on Selkirk Avenue, more than ever they've—more than they've ever discovered before.

Last month, they found 1,300 syringes behind an apartment on Manitoba Avenue and currently are on track to collect nearly 40,000 needles before the end of 2018. In past years, Bear Clan would find meth every now and then, but now they're pulling it off the streets on almost a weekly basis.

I want to uplift and honour the work that Bear Clan does. What began as an urgent response led by 12 North End residents, Bear Clan organization now has over twelve to thirteen hundred volunteers, each of whom have answered community calls for consistent action in making Winnipeg safer, as well as Brandon and across Canada.

Grievously, this government has not done the same. While meth continues to wring our province in a death grip, this government idly stands by. This government's inaction allows families to be ruined, lives to be taken and the safety of our front-line to be jeopardized. We need protection and—political lip service.

Please help me in congratulating Bear Clan Patrol on the soon-to-be-opened Bear Clan den at 584 Selkirk Ave. and, what's more, join me in thanking them for their incredible—

**Madam Speaker:** The member's time has expired.

The honourable member for Point Douglas—oh, you're finished?

Further member statements?

### Islamic History Month Canada

**Ms. Nahanni Fontaine (St. Johns):** In 2007, Canada officially recognized October as Canadian Islamic history month. In 2013, Manitoba became the first Canadian province to follow suit and celebrate Islamic heritage during the month of October.

Muslim Canadians have been a part of Canada's cultural mosaic since the very beginning. In 1871, the Canadian census reported 13 Muslims among the population of Canada, Madam Speaker. Manitoba's Muslim community has now grown to over 9,000 people from more than 48 national and cultural backgrounds. Muslim Canadians have made and continue to make significant contributions to Manitoba.

This month, the Manitoba Islamic social services hosted a variety of events to celebrate those contributions, attended by both our NDP leader and myself, that we had the privilege of attending: the 5th Annual Multicultural Tea Fest held at the Centre culturel franco-manitobain, and the Moose Hide Campaign Breaking the Fast.

\* (13:40)

It is important we recognize these celebrations in fostering acceptance, inclusion, respect and understanding within our collective community.

I say miigwech, Madam Speaker, to Shahina Siddiqui, the chair of the Islamic History Month Canada, and the countless others who make these events possible across Canada and Manitoba.

Miigwech.

### Provincial Economy and Conflict of Interest

**Hon. Steven Fletcher (Assiniboia):** A principled politician brings forward public policy and presents it to the public. In Manitoba, there seems to be an absence of principles, particularly in regard to taxation and the economy.

The Premier (Mr. Pallister) has refused to listen to the common sense of Manitobans. He refuses to

introduce conflict-of-interest legislation. He insists on the creation of a costly and creepy Crown corporation.

And, of course, there's the carbon tax. The spectacular flip-flop of the Premier (Mr. Pallister) has managed to undermine the legal challenges of Saskatchewan and Ontario and, in the same time, create a financial fiscal fiasco, made in Manitoba, due to poor planning and poor—just poor leadership.

Manitobans have tried to tell the Premier made-in-Manitoba financial fiasco had an NDP tag but now has the Premier's wrapping and a bow. He has spent Manitobans' time and energy. He has turned and undermined everyone on every side of the carbon tax debate. He can't have it all ways. He has tried to.

Madam Speaker, the Premier has done great harm—

**Madam Speaker:** The member's time has expired.

#### **575 Terrier Royal Canadian Air Cadets**

**Mr. Ian Wishart (Portage la Prairie):** Madam Speaker, I am honoured to inform this House about 575 Terrier Royal Canadian Air Cadet Squadron, based within the rural municipality of Portage la Prairie at Southport, who recently celebrated their 65th annual ceremonial review. The event is an opportunity to celebrate all the hard work of the cadets who have—put into their schooling and training exercises throughout the year.

The Royal Canadian Air Cadets participate in a variety of fun and challenging activities. There's something for everyone, no matter what your interests. Select top senior cadets may even have the chance to represent Canada on the world stage by participating in international exchanges. More importantly, air cadets aids in developing knowledge of Canadian history and democracy.

The cadet program focuses on social development, decision-making and leadership. As cadets retire—acquire skills and knowledge, they pass it along to the younger cadets. Every cadet has the chance to participate in flight activities, and some top senior cadets may even earn a scholarship to obtain their pilot licence. The annual ceremonial review signifies the end of the training year, which runs from September to May.

I ask all honourable members to join me in congratulating all of the participating cadets for their

dedication to the training and accomplishments they have achieved this year.

#### **Introduction of Guests**

**Madam Speaker:** Prior to oral questions, we have some guests that I would like to introduce to you.

Seated in the Speaker's Gallery we have with us today from Toronto the consul general of Israel, Mrs. Galit Baram; and Mr. Jordan Falkenstein, director of government relations, consulate of Israel.

We'd like to welcome you to Manitoba and to the Manitoba Legislature.

Also seated in the Speaker's Gallery we have with us today Mr. Greg Graceffo, associate deputy minister of Justice, who is retiring this week after many, many years serving the people of Manitoba in his role.

On behalf of all honourable members, I would like to say thank you to Mr. Graceffo on behalf of the Manitoba Legislative Assembly and all members here for the work that you have done over many years and the great support you've given to the Manitoba Legislative Assembly. Thank you.

And seated in the public gallery from Garden City Collegiate we have 50 grade 9 students under the direction of Lia Baffour-Awuah, and this group is located in the constituency of the honourable member for Kildonan (Mr. Curry).

On behalf of all honourable members here, we welcome all of you to the Manitoba Legislature.

#### **ORAL QUESTIONS**

##### **City of Winnipeg Provincial Relations**

**Mr. Wab Kinew (Leader of the Official Opposition):** Well, Madam Speaker, it's voting day here in Manitoba. That's right, Manitobans are flocking to the—*[interjection]*

**Madam Speaker:** Order.

**Mr. Kinew:** —polls to vote for their municipal leadership and school trustee leaders to represent them over the next few years.

Now, I think I speak on behalf of everyone in the House when I congratulate everyone who's put their name forward to represent their local community, certainly takes courage to put your name on the ballot and I wish everyone good luck, though there can only be one winner on any given ballot today.

When it comes to municipal relations, however, we've seen deterioration and distrust—discord, perhaps—you know, all sorts of dismay at City Hall as a result of the leadership of this Premier, and we know that his relationship has been fractured with the current mayor of Winnipeg and the city council. We see that he's picked fights even with his own allies on the former board of Manitoba Hydro.

Will the Premier commit to changing course and, instead, cultivating a good working relationship, including taking face-to-face meetings with the new mayor and council of Winnipeg?

**Hon. Brian Pallister (Premier):** I very much appreciate any question from the member opposite on the issues of distrust, and I appreciate the fact that the NDP eliminated a third of the municipalities of our province on the eve of their general meeting without a face-to-face meeting of any kind—no fax, no phone—[*interjection*]

**Madam Speaker:** Order.

**Mr. Pallister:** —no email, no communications of any kind, Madam Speaker. That created a climate of distrust.

So, Madam Speaker, what we have been doing is reaching out and working with the government—local governments, and we have developed relationships of trust instead.

**Madam Speaker:** The honourable Leader of the Official Opposition, on a supplementary question.

#### **Public Transit Services Municipal Funding Agreement**

**Mr. Wab Kinew (Leader of the Official Opposition):** Well, there goes the Premier singing from his familiar old songbook, Madam Speaker, [*interjection*] and it suggests that—

**Madam Speaker:** Order.

**Mr. Kinew:** —nothing will change when it comes to the relationship with the City of Winnipeg, and that's really a shame.

We've heard so many people bring up important issues in our city and, perhaps, none more salient to so many people across Winnipeg than the issue of transit. In fact, one of the City candidates, who is actually an employee of the Premier, has been campaigning on the issue to improve transit services here in the city of Winnipeg. That's right, there's a candidate in the municipal government who is an employee of the Premier, and she says that we

need dramatically improved transit here in the city of Winnipeg.

I think she's right, but she and probably many others are probably very surprised to hear that this is the very same Premier that she works for that axed the 50-50 funding agreement to support transit, downloading a slew of cuts and raising the cost of transit in our city.

As a result, will the Premier commit to reversing that terrible decision and reinstating the 50-50—

**Madam Speaker:** The member's time has expired.

**Hon. Brian Pallister (Premier):** I know why the member opposite wants more buses, Madam Speaker: because he wants to throw his own colleagues under more buses.

When it came time to be accountable, Madam Speaker, for the \$200-million waste at the stadium project, the member was nowhere to be seen. He was actually under the bus, hiding there. He blamed his former colleagues, didn't he.

When it came to be—time to be accountable on the untendered contracts to donors to the NDP in respect of—[*interjection*]

**Madam Speaker:** Order.

**Mr. Pallister:** —Tiger Dams, Madam Speaker, he said, don't ask me, I wasn't there, and threw his colleagues under the bus.

When it came time to deal with the issues of harassment that have been hidden in his party for years and years, he said, don't blame me, that was the old guys, some of which surround him now.

\* (13:50)

He was very quick to blame other people and throw them under the bus, Madam Speaker, but most of all, when the NDP raised taxes after saying they wouldn't, he said, it wasn't my fault, it was the NDP before me.

**Madam Speaker:** The honourable Leader of the Official Opposition, on a final supplementary.

#### **Methamphetamine Crisis Request for Treatment Programs**

**Mr. Wab Kinew (Leader of the Official Opposition):** Madam Speaker, the Premier had a choice to make: he could spend \$200 million on health care in the city of Winnipeg—[*interjection*]

**Madam Speaker:** Order.

**Mr. Kinew:** –or he could spend \$200 million on the stadium. He chose to spend \$200 million on the stadium. We–

**Some Honourable Members:** Oh, oh.

**Madam Speaker:** Order.

**Mr. Kinew:** –would choose to spend the \$200 million on health care–

**Some Honourable Members:** Oh, oh.

**Madam Speaker:** Order.

**Mr. Kinew:** –every single time.

**Some Honourable Members:** Oh, oh.

**Madam Speaker:** Order.

There's a lot of noise in here and I'm having difficulty hearing, and I'm sure the students that are in the gallery are likely having trouble hearing too. And people do want to hear the questions and answers, so I would ask for everybody's co-operation. We are only on question No. 1, so I would ask for everybody's co-operation, please.

The honourable Leader of the Official Opposition, to complete his question.

**Mr. Kinew:** Well, time flies when you're having fun, Madam Speaker.

As I was saying, there's been broad support for a safe consumption site here in Winnipeg. It's urgently needed to fight the meth crisis here in our streets–  
[interjection]

**Madam Speaker:** Order.

**Mr. Kinew:** –but this is an issue right across the province, Madam Speaker. Folks in Brandon have their own asks to respond to the unique situation there as well. They want a detox facility in Brandon. Right now, if you want to detox from Brandon, you have to drive to the city of Winnipeg and go to Main Street Project.

Now, this–if the City of Winnipeg and the City of Brandon are supporting these requests to fight the meth crisis, will the Premier step out of the way, stop opposing these initiatives on ideological grounds–

**Madam Speaker:** The member's time has expired.

**Hon. Brian Pallister (Premier):** The meth issue is one of grave concern to all of us, I believe, in this House, and it requires serious solutions, not one-offs and instant solutions, Madam Speaker, as the member and his colleagues continue to espouse.

I would also like to add my thanks and our government's thanks to all who have allowed their name to be on the ballot. Freedom is about choice, Madam Speaker, and the choices are there for Manitobans today because people in our province have the courage to put their names on the ballot, as all members of this House have done. And so we respect that and thank them in that, and we will look forward to working with the victors, and we do appreciate the participation of all in this important democratic process.

**Madam Speaker:** The honourable Leader of the Official Opposition, on a new question.

### Federal Carbon Pricing Litigation Inquiry

**Mr. Wab Kinew (Leader of the Official Opposition):** Took him three tries to finally answer the question; still won't commit to meeting with the mayor of Winnipeg, Madam Speaker.

Now, we know that one of the great challenges of our time is meeting the challenge of global warming. Fighting against climate change, it really is a fight for our future, and this is one of the battles that we need to wage–[interjection]

**Madam Speaker:** Order.

**Mr. Kinew:** –on behalf of future generations in Manitoba, but also on behalf of young people who are with us right now, Madam Speaker. We need to ensure that they can have the same or better quality of life, but that won't happen if we defer action on climate change to the next generation.

We know that, so far, the Premier has insisted on trying to pick a fight with the federal government over the issue of putting a price on pollution. Yesterday, in a scrum, in fact, he said that somebody needs to fight this issue in court.

Does that mean that he intends to take the federal government to court for their efforts to combat climate change?

**Hon. Brian Pallister (Premier):** The member opposite, along with the federal government, has decided that they want to have a fight–a politically motivated fight, I'm afraid, Madam Speaker–about taxing for carbon when what we should be doing is unifying ourselves to fight climate change. That's what this government is about, and that's what we'll continue to be about. When the member opposite decides he wants to say yes to a carbon tax, we'll say

yes to a green plan for Manitoba and a better future for all of us.

**Madam Speaker:** The honourable Leader of the Official Opposition, on a supplementary question.

### **Emissions Reduction Government Record**

**Mr. Wab Kinew (Leader of the Official Opposition):** The problem with the Premier's position, Madam Speaker, is that up until a few weeks ago he said that putting a price on pollution was the most effective way to combat global warming.

Now, I'm not sure what happened in that conversation that he blames—the conversation with the Prime Minister—that he blames for his flip-flop, but the scientific consensus and the economic consensus hasn't changed: putting a price on pollution is an important part of fighting climate change.

It is going to take more than just cheques in the mail to fight global warming, but that rebate and carbon-price strategy should be the beginning of action that we need to fight global warming, Madam Speaker.

Now, we know that his minister couldn't name one initiative that they've taken to reduce emissions, yesterday, so I'd ask the Premier whether he can point to any single green initiative his government has taken and how much emissions reductions it has led to here in Manitoba.

**Hon. Brian Pallister (Premier):** Sure, Madam Speaker, gladly. I'd be honoured to do that.

We've reduced the size of the government fleet by a full 20 per cent.

**Madam Speaker:** The honourable Leader of the Official Opposition, on a final supplementary.

### **Climate and Green Plan Act Amendments to Bill 16**

**Mr. Wab Kinew (Leader of the Official Opposition):** The question was about carbon capture, but we know that the Premier captured 20 per cent more of his salary before he froze it and brought in a wage freeze across public sector employees.

Now, of course, the jousting that we do here in the House is one matter, but the reality on the ground across our—*[interjection]*

**Madam Speaker:** Order.

**Mr. Kinew:** —province, the reality right across our country, is that urgent action is needed to reduce emissions, and the reduction of pollution is really an investment that we're making for future generations in our province. This is about handing down a future to our children, whether those kids live in Morris or whether or those kids live in the city of Winnipeg or in northern Manitoba.

But the bottom line is that we have to take action and we have to take action now. We've committed to bringing forward several amendments at the committee, if the Liberals allow the committee to sit tonight, and we would like to know whether or not the government will support us in putting the science first on climate change, putting a price on carbon and, of course—and ensuring that we miss—that we meet the IPCC targets for the reduction of emissions, Madam Speaker.

**Hon. Brian Pallister (Premier):** The member says we should commit to action, action which wasn't in evidence for 17 years while the NDP were in government, Madam Speaker, 17 years when action on climate change could've been taken and nothing was done.

So, Madam Speaker, I and the members of this government fervently believe that we have an obligation to future generations not only for environmental sustainability, but for fiscal sustainability too.

And, you know, Madam Speaker, the member wants to have it both ways, but the fact remains that they doubled the debt of our province in just six years before the last election, and that debt will be repaid by the young people upstairs in the gallery and all of those who come after us. That's not an example of understanding about the importance of next generation's security; that's an example of not understanding, at all, our obligation to the next generation.

### **Introduction of Guests**

**Madam Speaker:** Before proceeding, we just have some other guests that have come into the gallery, and I'm not sure how long they're here for so I would like to take this opportunity to introduce them to you.

Seated in the public gallery from Steinbach Christian School we have 46 grade 9 students under the direction of Curt Plett, and this group is located



in the constituency of the honourable Minister of Education and Training.

And we welcome all of you to the Manitoba Legislature.

**Education Review Commission  
School Division Taxation Powers**

**Mr. Matt Wiebe (Concordia):** On Monday, students from Gimli High School came to the Legislature. They showed incredible courage as they represented their community, who has rallied around the school's music program. The school division has a plan to build this project. The community is in support of it, and yet the Premier said no, all the while his caucus laughing at the students' plight in this Legislature.

**Some Honourable Members:** Oh, oh.

**Madam Speaker:** Order. Order. Order. Order.

**Mr. Wiebe:** All of this after his Minister of Education said the best decisions are made at the local level.

Now that the minister has broken that promise, I ask him: What other projects have been cancelled or frozen pending his education review?

**Hon. Kelvin Goertzen (Minister of Education and Training):** Well, of course, Madam Speaker, none of 'wuch'—what my honourable friend says is true. We take the issue of capital investments in schools very seriously as evidenced by seven new schools which are being built.

Unlike the NDP, I have a number of examples that I can cite. I'll cite one for them: the École Charleswood School. For 40 years they had a roof that got worse and worse every year. In fact, it was leaking for the last many years, resulting in mould growing in the school. In 2009 they asked the NDP for support to fix the roof so that they could get rid of the mould. In 2009 they said no, 2010, '11, '12, '13, '14, '15. They said no every year. It finally got done when we came into government in November of 2016. *[interjection]*

\* (14:00)

**Madam Speaker:** Order. Order.

The honourable member for Concordia, on a supplementary question.

**Mr. Wiebe:** Well, this government in fact said yes to this project as well—in 2016. But then in 2018 they pulled out, even after the community rallied together,

raised the money, came up with a plan and presented it to this government. It makes no sense, Madam Speaker, especially because the minister told school divisions in 2016, quote: You have your own taxing power. There is no suggestion that that is going to change.

So, the minister promised that school divisions will have the ability to set their budget on things like education taxes. It helps pay for things like music rooms, and yet this minister is stepping away from that promise.

Is he going to keep that commitment and rule out stripping school divisions of local taxation in the terms of reference from his review?

**Mr. Goertzen:** Madam Speaker, I'm glad that the member raises the issue of the terrible condition that the NDP left our schools. I gave an example on the first answer, I'll give another example.

The Louis Riel School Division, Arts and Technology Centre, their roof was also leaking, Madam Speaker. There were multiple splits and patches weren't helping, so the roof continued to leak and there was potential mould that was going to be growing in that school as well. So in 2009, they came and asked the NDP for support to fix the leaky roof. The NDP said no. They said no in 2010, '11, '12, '13, '14, '15.

Of course, they had time to vote themselves a vote tax at that time to give their political party money, but they said no to the Louis Riel School Division and all those students.

But, thankfully, we got elected and it was done in 2016, Madam Speaker. *[interjection]*

**Madam Speaker:** Order. Order.

The honourable member for Concordia, on a final supplementary.

**Mr. Wiebe:** Madam Speaker, it's—

**Some Honourable Members:** Oh, oh.

**Madam Speaker:** Order. We still have students in the gallery, so I would ask for everybody's co-operation, please.

The honourable member from—for Concordia, on a final supplementary.

**Mr. Wiebe:** Well, Madam Speaker, it's this minister who is saying no to this project in 2016, in 2017, in 2018, and now this project won't move ahead beyond 2019 because this minister is standing in the way.

He said that: Sitting on Broadway, we don't know everything. The best decisions are made at the local level because they know what is happening in their area, and more than that it is about respect.

And yet now, the minister sitting in his office on Broadway is saying no to this project. That's not respect, Madam Speaker. That's not respect at all.

I'll ask him again: Does he intend to strip local taxation from other projects that he has frozen because of his review?

**Mr. Goertzen:** Well, the member is right: sitting on Broadway you don't always know all the information that you'd like to.

But, certainly, the former NDP government, sitting on Broadway in government, did know that over at the King George School, in 2011 they came to the NDP government and talked about their 38-year-old roof. They had multiple splits and patches. In fact, the roof was leaking significantly as a result of it being so old and unable to retain water out of it, Madam Speaker.

So they came and they asked the NDP in 2011 for support. They said no. Madam Speaker, 2012, they said no; '13, '14, '15, '16—they said no for five years. But, thankfully, hope was on the way for King George School, because we were elected and in 2016 the roof was fixed, Madam Speaker.

#### **Methamphetamine Crisis Prevention Resources Needed**

**Mrs. Bernadette Smith (Point Douglas):** Meth-related hospital visits are up 1,200 per cent and there's a 700 increase in addiction treatment due to meth.

The Bear Clan, that works in my area and across the city, say that they have seen a tenfold increase in the number of needles that they find disposed. That's consistent with—this government already knows that injection of meth among intravenous drug users has exploded from 6 per cent to over 50 per cent, and deaths from meth overdose have doubled.

Volunteers from the Bear Clan have said that it's a miracle that more people haven't died. In fact, they shared today that three of their own members have been buried, one of which was only 18 years old.

I'll ask the minister: Where is his plan to address this growing meth crisis?

**Hon. Cameron Friesen (Minister of Health, Seniors and Active Living):** We welcome members

of the Bear Clan to the gallery today. We thank them for the incredible front-line work that they are doing each and every day.

They, among others in Manitoba, understand that there is something very significant occurring in respect of methamphetamine addiction in our communities. We are not alone. Having reached out just very recently to my counterpart in Saskatchewan, they indicate the same kind of scourge affecting their communities. That's why we're taking action on things like rapid addictions medicine. It's why we're taking actions on addictions beds, and we'll continue to take action.

**Madam Speaker:** The honourable member for Point Douglas, on a supplementary question.

**Mrs. Smith:** I couldn't imagine what our city would be like without Bear Clan. It's not only their responsible—responsibility; it's a responsibility of this government, and they're doing nothing.

It seems that this minister claims to be listening, but we don't even know if he cares. He's putting nothing into stopping this meth problem from increasing. People are dying, families are being torn apart, and this minister is doing nothing.

I'll ask him again: Where are the resources to deal with this crisis and where are—the mental health crisis that we're in? Will the minister listen and put more resources into addressing this meth crisis happening in our city so that more people aren't dying at the expense of this government?

**Mr. Friesen:** The member for Point Douglas is quite wrong, and she knows she knows she's wrong, because she's heard in this House about the very significant difference that things like rapid addiction to—access to addiction medicine is making in communities like Winnipeg, in the new centre in Brandon we opened last week, in the new centre in Thompson we opened last week.

What is the effect of those things? A much faster treatment cycle from someone identifying with addictions, a reduction in ER, a reduction in length of stay. This is evidence that our plan is working, and there will be more investments to come.

**Madam Speaker:** The honourable member for Point Douglas, on a final supplementary.

**Mrs. Smith:** This minister is wrong. He doesn't understand what's going on in Manitoba. I ask him to come to my community and come and visit the people who are on the street. Visit with the families

who are experiencing this, that have no support to support their family members who are dealing with meth.

He's talking about RAAM. Well, James Favel of the Bear Clan, today: Simply opening RAAM clinics for 10 hours combined a week is not enough. They want to see more resources from this government. They're calling on them as well as we are. We're sick and tired of them sitting on their hands, putting earplugs in their ears and not listening, not seeing what's going on because they don't care.

So I'll ask this minister again: Where is the resources? They're asking that this government treat meth like the crisis that it is. What will this—

**Madam Speaker:** The member's time has expired.

**Mr. Friesen:** That member knows that the Minister of Justice (Mr. Cullen) for this government was recently just announcing more actions undertaken, with Sel Burrows, at a meeting that he had. That member knows that a number of my colleagues travelled to the Main Street Project earlier this year to meet directly with front-line workers. That member knows about many actions being undertaken, and it is with recklessness that she implies that somehow nothing is being done.

She knows that the true way forward in dealing with methamphetamine addiction is partnership and collaboration. We will have no part of what she's doing. We will continue to have partnership and collaboration built with Manitobans to make a real difference in the lives of these families.

### **Lead Contamination Levels Request for Clean-Up Plan**

**Mr. Dougald Lamont (Leader of the Second Opposition):** Madam Speaker, one year ago today the Minister of Sustainable Development (Ms. Squires) tabled a report that showed hugely elevated lead levels in soil in Weston, Point Douglas and other neighbourhoods.

On September 13th of this year, the media reported that the NDP had left that report unpublished for a decade, but a year and a half of that decade was under this government, who, like the NDP, did nothing about it.

We keep hearing about 17 years of NDP failures, but this stretches back decades. I will quote one of my constituents: Over 30 years and seven governments, there doesn't seem to be any difference between the PCs and the NDP. They both know

about lead contamination, they both cover it up and they both do nothing about it.

What is this government's plan to inform residents and clean up this mess?

\* (14:10)

**Hon. Brian Pallister (Premier):** Well, I appreciate the member raising the topic. It's an important one. He is partly right: the NDP government previously did the test but did not disclose the results. That is a fact, and that happened many years ago and it continued as a cover-up for many years.

What he is wrong about, Madam Speaker, is the performance of this minister and our government. This minister undertook—first of all, do air quality testing, also to do soil testing in the area. She went above and beyond to do those tests and to have them done, and she went above and beyond to release the results.

So the member is partly right, but he is mostly wrong, Madam Speaker.

**Madam Speaker:** The honourable Leader of the Second Opposition, on a supplementary question.

**Mr. Lamont:** A year ago last week, October 16th, 2'17, the Minister of Sustainable Development held a press conference when she told residents of St. Boniface they had no need to worry about lead in their soil. When new tests this year showed she was wrong and that there were elevated lead levels, her department withheld those results before and during a by-election.

I have had constituents who are pregnant who have asked whether their food is safe to eat. I wrote a letter to the minister and received no reply, and there has been no public communication from her department.

The by-election is over: Why is there still a communications blackout from this government?

**Mr. Pallister:** Well, nothing could be further from the truth, Madam Speaker. I will simply say again that the minister went above and beyond in ordering the test results, and above and beyond in this—in sharing those results with the affected homeowners, going so far as to actually have the results delivered to the homes themselves. And so, again, the member is making erroneous assertions.

He is correct, though, that the NDP did cover up these results, and had he asserted that they also did this in other areas of the city, such as areas like

Point Douglas, where the irate member earlier posed a question. She doesn't seem to be so irate about her colleagues covering up results that were far more dangerous and damaging in her own riding, Madam Speaker, but she should be.

**Madam Speaker:** The honourable Leader of the Second Opposition, on a final supplementary.

**Mr. Lamont:** The Minister of Sustainable Development (Ms. Squires) and I met with the south saint 'bonifisents' residents association, and more than anything they want a solution to their problem after being ignored and dismissed for years.

The previous NDP government signed off on an environmental licence to companies which allowed new machinery to be installed which may be vaporizing toxic metals and spewing them into the air. In the 2008 report on lead contamination that both the NDP and the PCs suppressed, it made clear that one of the concentrated sources of lead and other metals is scrap metal recycling and smelters.

This May, the minister told the House you'd do nothing to reverse the NDP's mistake.

Is this government going to act, or are they just going to keep doubling down on the failures of the NDP?

**Mr. Pallister:** Well, no. No, Madam Speaker, we won't double down on the failures of the NDP.

We are taking action. The minister has not only taken initial action, she has ordered further testing to be done, as the member is aware but fails to mention in his preamble.

And I can only be puzzled, as I expect the people of St. Boniface would be puzzled, as to why some two months after his election, the first issue he raised was not this one, but rather, instead, a demand for greater office space.

#### **Northern Patient Transportation Program Patient Escorts and Travel Difficulties**

**Ms. Amanda Lathlin (The Pas):** Patients who are medevac'd from northern Manitoba are responsible for finding their own way back home. This included myself and my daughters twice.

Can you imagine having a medical emergency in northern Manitoba, waking up in Winnipeg and trying to figure out how you'll get home? You don't have a vehicle, English may not be your first language and maybe you can't afford the trip back.

These are the kinds of problems that this government should be focused on, not privatization of Lifeflight and cutting the Northern Patient Transportation Program.

Will this government stop its privatization approach, reverse its cuts to that Northern Patient Transportation Program and focus on the issues that northerners really care about?

**Hon. Cameron Friesen (Minister of Health, Seniors and Active Living):** I want that member to understand clearly that she is incorrect, and she should cease and desist from the arguments that somehow a program has been changed when, in fact, there is no change to the northern transportation system.

The system she talks about is in place. She knows that the transportation method is chosen by the doctor. She knows that there continues to be support for a travelling person to accompany them, but these decisions are made clinically by the doctor. There's no change to the program.

**Madam Speaker:** The honourable member for The Pas, on a supplementary question.

**Ms. Lathlin:** Under the Northern Patient Transportation Program, patients travelling by bus had the option to pay an extra \$75 to take a plane. Now my constituents are telling me that through this Northern Patient Transportation Program, they are now being discouraged from pursuing this option.

We know that the Premier's (Mr. Pallister) long reach stretches all the way to northern Manitoba, where his health cuts are making lives harder for us northern Manitobans.

Can this Minister for Health explain why northern patients are being discouraged from pursuing an option that might save their life, Madam Speaker?

**Mr. Friesen:** Well, I want to repeat to that member that under the Northern Patient Transportation Program, there are no changes to the program. But I can assure her that the program continues to be run in such a way as to make it sustainable.

Those decisions are made by doctors. There's clear parameters that then order when a patient should have a condition that would require flights and when the condition would require ground transportation. And there are criteria, as well, as to when an accompaniment travel can go with them. So those changes—or those program details remain in

place and there are no changes that we can point to in the way that program is being run.

**Madam Speaker:** The honourable member for The Pas, on a final supplementary.

**Ms. Lathlin:** Resa Yaremko is 80 years old. Under this government, she was told to take a bus to Winnipeg for a hip replacement surgery—alone. Under this government, an 80-year-old woman was denied an escort, told to travel 10 hours to Winnipeg and get around Winnipeg by taxi—alone. Then, after hip replacement surgery, travel another 10 hours back to The Pas—alone. She only got an escort in the end because her son stood up and fought for his mother.

He shouldn't have had to do that, Madam Speaker. He shouldn't have had to do that.

Can the Minister for Health explain why, under his government, an 80-year-old woman, a hip replacement patient, was told to travel 10 hours alone, to and from Winnipeg?

**Mr. Friesen:** Well, the member will understand that I, as the Minister of Health, cannot speak to any specific situation she raises. But in principle, she would also understand that I, as the Minister of Health, do not make the program decisions to determine when air transportation or when ground transportation is needed. But the member should understand that the program remains in place, it is there to support northern patients travelling to appointments. Yes, those decisions are undertaken—*[interjection]*

**Madam Speaker:** Order. Order.

**Mr. Friesen:** —and the decisions are undertaken by doctors according to program criteria, as they have been and will continue to be.

### **Budget 2019 Government Consultations**

**Mr. Reg Helwer (Brandon West):** Madam Speaker, our government has made great progress over the past three budgets to correct the course in a responsible manner. We are keeping our promises and making real progress to eliminate the deficit and return to balance while making record investments in education, health and families. And we are getting better results.

Can the Minister of Finance share with us what he is doing to prepare for our next budget in 2019?

**Hon. Scott Fielding (Minister of Finance):** Well, thank you, Madam Speaker. *[interjection]*

**Madam Speaker:** Order. Order.

**Mr. Fielding:** It is a pleasure to be all over Manitoba doing budget consultations in places like Thompson, places like Flin Flon—*[interjection]*

**Madam Speaker:** Order.

**Mr. Fielding:** —places like Dauphin, places like Brandon, where we met with hundreds of Manitobans to get ideas and priorities of what to put in the government.

What we clearly hear from Manitobans is they're taxed to the max. That's something our government is working on. They—it encouraged us to invest in things like health care, education and social services, and that's what we're doing. And a part of our budget consultations, Madam Speaker—we're not done yet, and we continue doing budget consultations. We have a session that's fully accessible and bilingual tomorrow night here at the Legislature. We invite everyone to come out.

We also have an online tool for Manitobans to engage in the budget process, Madam Speaker.

\* (14:20)

### **Provincial Nominee Program Government Intention**

**Ms. Cindy Lamoureux (Burrows):** Madam Speaker, we know that the—*[interjection]*

**Madam Speaker:** Order.

**Ms. Lamoureux:** —Provincial Nominee Program plays a critical and economic and social success in our province. That's why it is concerning that the current mandate letter for the minister responsible is two years out of date.

I wanted to give the newly appointed minister an opportunity to share with the House his plans for the future of the Provincial Nominee Program.

**Hon. Kelvin Goertzen (Minister of Education and Training):** Certainly, Madam Speaker, I'm pleased to talk about the future of the PNP program, but it's—it would be remiss if I didn't give a little bit of a nod to the past before I speak to the future.

And more than 20 years ago—or 20 years ago, actually, this year, the former Filmon government put in place the PNP program under the leadership of people like Bonnie Mitchelson and

Harold Gilleshammer and Rosemary Vodrey, who were all involved with the Provincial Nominee Program in their time in that ministry.

Since then, there have been—and of course, the current Premier (Mr. Pallister), of course, who sat in that government, Madam Speaker. Little bit of job protection there.

But we've had more than 130,000 people who have come to Manitoba to call Manitoba home. That was the past; we've got a great future.

**Madam Speaker:** The honourable member for Burrows, on a supplementary question. [*interjection*] Order.

### Participant Reduction

**Ms. Lamoureux:** Madam Speaker, 130,000 immigrants have settled in Manitoba through the Provincial Nominee Program since 1998: 85 per cent were working within three months and 76 per cent were homeowners within three to five years.

In the minister's most recent annual report, Manitoba shows a significant decrease—we're talking thousands of immigrants not coming to Manitoba—compared to the year previous.

Madam Speaker, given the success rates, why is the minister allowing the numbers of immigrants coming to our province through the Provincial Nominee Program to decrease?

**Mr. Goertzen:** Madam Speaker, there is no doubt that some policy changes by the federal government have made it harder for certain individuals to come to Canada. That is certainly already some of the discussions that I've had with the federal Immigration Minister. I want to continue to have those discussions.

Certainly, I would welcome any influence that she might have with her friends in Ottawa, Madam Speaker, who she often defends in the House. I hope she would also go and bring our case to Ottawa to try to ensure that we can welcome as many people to Manitoba as we can so that they can find hope here as well.

But I want to give credit to the former minister, the member for Portage la Prairie (Mr. Wishart), who did a tremendous job on this file in shortening the wait times and ensuring that many people could come to Manitoba, Madam Speaker.

**Madam Speaker:** The honourable member for Burrows, on a final supplementary.

### Professional Accreditation

**Ms. Lamoureux:** Madam Speaker, there are thousands of people who have immigrated to Manitoba and are being forced to work in fields that are not at all related to their expertise or level of education. This takes away from the prosperity of our province and forces limitations upon people.

What is the minister going to do about these barriers that skilled workers who are pursuing professional accreditation are often faced with here in Manitoba?

**Mr. Goertzen:** Madam Speaker, there's already been good work that's been done by our government since coming into government, whether it's dealing with the Fair Practices Office, which falls within the department.

I know that in my former role as minister of Health we'd often hear from individuals who had come to Canada with certain skills that they had in their home countries and they didn't necessarily match the skills that they needed here in Canada for the various occupations they were interested in.

We, of course, work with the individual colleges who set the standards. There's been good work to ensure that information can be provided in terms of getting skill upgrade, or those who are coming to Canada know what the requirements are for the occupations that they want to fulfill, Madam Speaker.

### Northern Air Services Privatization Concerns

**Mr. Tom Lindsey (Flin Flon):** Madam Speaker, we've seen the effect of privatization in this province already: the Port of Churchill, the rail line from Churchill, privatized, and this government used that as an excuse to do nothing. The Premier held up his hands, said, well, don't look at us. It's somebody else. Got to be somebody else, not us.

You know what, now this government is talking about privatizing air ambulances and water bombers. And when they're not there when people in the North need them, are they going to sit on their hands again and say, well, it's not us, it's nothing to do with us, or will they step up, support people in the North so that there's an air ambulance and a water bomber there when they need them?

**Hon. Brian Pallister (Premier):** Madam Speaker, the NDP tripled the amount of private sector provision for air ambulance in their last five years in government, and so the member is trying to make a phony ideological battle relevant when it's irrelevant, as was much of his preamble.

But I would say this: We very much value improving the services to people of our province. Where we languished in 10th out of 10th place under the NDP—and they broke the system, we're fixing it.

**Madam Speaker:** The honourable member for Flin Flon, on a final supplementary.

**Mr. Lindsey:** Madam Speaker, we've read in the Free Press where a pilot that works for the government air ambulance service—*[interjection]*

**Madam Speaker:** Order.

**Mr. Lindsey:** —doesn't see any potential cost savings—*[interjection]*

**Madam Speaker:** Order.

**Mr. Lindsey:** —with this Premier's gamble. What they've done, Madam Speaker, with their RFP is lower the standards that are required. Planes will be allowed to go slower. They won't be pressurized.

Madam Speaker, they're putting people's lives at risk.

Will this government continue with its gamble with lower standards like we've seen with snow-plowing airports in the North on weekends, like we've seen with their RFP, or will they stand up for people in the North and maintain the best flight, the best possible service for people in the North?

**Mr. Pallister:** Well, yes to the best possible services for the people in the North, but that certainly wasn't the case under the NDP government, Madam Speaker. They did increase their reliance on privatized air services annually, but they did so without shopping intelligently. They did so without tendering for the services. They spun a little thing on the wall and said, they get it this time.

They didn't negotiate on the price, and so Manitoba taxpayers paid more to get less and northerners didn't get any more value for money, and northerners care about value for money, Madam Speaker, which is why the people in that member's riding don't want the federal government's hands in their pocket with a big carbon tax, and he has to go out there and try to tell them they should like it.

**Madam Speaker:** Time for oral questions has expired.

## PETITIONS

### Seven Oaks General Hospital Emergency Room

**Mrs. Bernadette Smith (Point Douglas):** I wish to present the following petition to the Legislative Assembly.

The background to this petition is as follows:

(1) The provincial government has announced the closure of three emergency rooms and an urgent-care centre in the city of Winnipeg, including closing down emergency rooms at Seven Oaks General Hospital.

(2) The closures came on the heels of the closing of a nearby QuickCare clinic, as well as cancelled plans for ACCESS centres and personal-care homes, such as Park Manor, that would have provided important services for families and seniors in the area.

(3) The closures have left families and seniors in north Winnipeg without any point of contact with front-line services and will result in them having to travel 20 minutes or more to St. Boniface Hospital's emergency room or Health Sciences Centre's emergency room for emergency care.

(4) These cuts come—will place a heavy burden on the many seniors who live in north Winnipeg and visit the emergency room frequently, especially for those who are unable to drive or are low income.

(5) The provincial government failed to consult with families and seniors in north Winnipeg regarding the closing of these emergency rooms or to consult with health-care officials and health-care workers at Seven Oaks to discuss how these closures would impact patient care in advance of the announcement.

We petition the Legislative Assembly of Manitoba as follows:

To urge the province of—provincial government to reverse the decision to close Seven Oaks General Hospital's emergency room so that families and seniors in north Winnipeg and the surrounding areas can have timely access to quality health-care services.

This is signed by Mely Cavero *[phonetic]*, Alvin Fornnat, Bryan Banaag and many, many other Manitobans.

**Madam Speaker:** In accordance with our rule 133(6), when petitions they are deemed to be received by the House.

### Vimy Arena

**Hon. Steven Fletcher (Assiniboia):** I'd like to present the following petition to the Legislative Assembly.

The background of this petition is as follows:

(1) The residents of St. James and other areas of Manitoba are concerned with the intention expressed by the provincial government to use the Vimy Arena site as a Manitoba Housing project.

(2) The Vimy Arena site is in the middle of a residential area near many schools, churches community clubs and senior homes, and neither the provincial government nor the City of Winnipeg considered better-suited locations in rural, semi-rural or industrial sites, such as St. Boniface industrial park, the 20,000 acres at CentrePort or existing properties such as the Shriners Hospital or the old Children's Hospital on Wellington Crescent.

(3) The provincial government is exempt from any re-zoning—or, any zoning requirements that would have existed if the land was owned by the City of Winnipeg. This exemption bypasses community input and due diligence, and ignores better uses for the land which would be consistent with a residential area.

(4) There are no standards that one would expect for a treatment centre. The Minister of Health, Seniors and Active Living has stated the Department of Health had no role to play in the acquisition of land for this Manitoba Housing project to be used as a drug addiction facility.

(5) The Manitoba Housing project initiated by the provincial government changes the fundamental nature of the community. Including park and recreation uses, concerns of the residents of St. James and others regarding public safety, property values and the way of life are not being properly addressed.

(6) The concerns of the residents of St. James are being ignored while obvious other locations in wealthier neighbourhoods, such as Tuxedo and River Heights, have not been considered for the Manitoba Housing project, even though there are hundreds of acres of land available for development at Kapyong or parks like Heubach Park that share the same zoning as the Vimy Arena site.

(7) The Manitoba Housing project and the operation of a drug treatment centre fall outside the statutory mandate of the Manitoba Housing renewal corporation.

(8) The provincial government does not have a co-ordinated plan for addiction treatment in Manitoba, as it currently underfunds treatment centres which are running far under capacity and potential.

(9) The community has been misled regarding the true intention of Manitoba Housing, as the land is being transferred for a 50-bed facility even though the project is clearly outside of Manitoba Housing responsibility.

We petition the Legislative Assembly of Manitoba as follows:

(1) To urge the provincial government to take the necessary steps to ensure that the Vimy Arena site is not used for an addiction treatment facility; and

(2) To urge the provincial government to take the necessary steps to ensure that the preservation of public land along Sturgeon Creek for the purposes of park land and recreation activities for public use, including being an important component of the Sturgeon Creek Greenway Trail and Sturgeon Creek ecosystem under the current designation PR2 for the 255 Hamilton Ave. location at the Vimy Arena site, and to maintain the land to continue to be designated for parks and recreation, neighbourhood and community.

Madam Speaker, this has been signed by scores of constituents. Thank you.

### Medical Laboratory Services

**Hon. Jon Gerrard (River Heights):** I wish to present the following petition to the Manitoba Legislature:

The background of this petition is as follows:

The provision of laboratory services to medical clinics and physicians' offices has been historically and continues to be a private sector service.

It is vitally important that there be competition in laboratory services to allow medical clinics to seek solutions from more than one provider to control costs and to improve service for health professionals and patients.



Under the present provincial government, Dynacare, an Ontario-based subsidiary of a US company, has acquired Unicity labs, resulting in a monopoly situation for the provision of laboratory services in medical clinics and physicians' offices.

The creation of this monopoly has resulted in the closure of many laboratories by Dynacare in and around the city of Winnipeg. Since the acquisition of Unicity labs, Dynacare has engaged in anti-competitive activities where it has changed the collection schedules of patients' specimens and charged some medical offices for collection services.

These closures have created a situation where a great number of patients are less well served, having to travel significant distances in some cases, waiting considerable periods of time and sometimes being denied or having to leave without obtaining lab services. This situation is particularly critical for patients requiring fasting blood draws as they may experience complications that could be life-threatening based on their individual health situations.

Furthermore, Dynacare has instructed that all STAT's patients, patients with suspicious internal infections, be directed to its King Edward location. This creates unnecessary obstacles for the patients who are required to travel to that lab, rather than simply completing the test in their doctor's office. This new directive by Dynacare presents a direct risk to patients' health in the interest of higher profits. This has further resulted in patients opting to visit emergency rooms rather than traveling twice, which increases cost to the health-care system.

Medical clinics and physicians' offices service thousands of patients in their communities and have structured their offices to provide a one-stop shop, acting as a health-care front line that takes off some of the load from emergency rooms. The creation of this monopoly has been problematic to many medical clinics and physicians, hampering their ability to provide high quality and complete service to their patients due to closures of so many laboratories.

We petition the Legislative Assembly of Manitoba as follows:

(1) To urge the provincial government to request Dynacare to reopen the closed laboratories or allow Diagnostic Services of Manitoba to freely open labs in clinics which formerly housed labs that have been shut down by Dynacare.

(2) To urge the provincial government to ensure high quality lab services for patients and a level playing field and competition in the provision of laboratory services to medical offices.

(3) To urge the provincial government to address this matter immediately in the interest of better patient focused care and improved support for health professionals.

Signed by Tracy Price, Danny Carmichael [*phonetic*] and Tracey Deane [*phonetic*].

### **Tina Fontaine—Public Inquiry**

**Mr. James Allum (Fort Garry-Riverview):** I wish to present the following petition to the Legislative Assembly.

These are the reasons for this petition.

(1) Tina Fontaine was murdered at the age of 15 years and her body was found in the Red River on August 17, 2014.

(2) Tina Fontaine was robbed of her loving family and the Anishinabe community of Sagkeeng First Nation.

(3) Tina Fontaine was failed by multiple systems which did not protect her as they intervened in her life.

(4) Tina Fontaine was further failed by systems meant to seek and pursue justice for her murder.

(5) Tina Fontaine's murder galvanized Canada on the issue of missing and murdered indigenous women and girls, MMIWG, as she quickly became our collective daughter and the symbol of MMIWG across Canada.

(6) Manitoba has failed to fully implement the recommendations of numerous reports and recommendations meant to improve and protect the lives of indigenous peoples and children, including the Aboriginal Justice Inquiry, Royal Commission on Aboriginal Peoples and the Phoenix Sinclair inquiry.

We petition the Legislative Assembly as follows:

(1) To urge the Premier of Manitoba and the Minister of Justice to immediately call a public inquiry into the systems that had a role in the life and death of Tina Fontaine, as well as the function of the administration of justice after her death.

\* (14:40)

(2) To urge that the terms of reference of a public inquiry be developed jointly with the caregivers of Tina Fontaine and/or the agent appointed by them.

Madam Speaker, this petition is signed by Bernice Marish [*phonetic*], L. Scott and P.L. Vanderelst and many other Manitobans.

#### **Concordia Hospital Emergency Room**

**Mr. Matt Wiebe (Concordia):** I wish to present the following petition to the Legislative Assembly.

The background to this petition is as follows:

(1) The provincial government has announced the closures of three emergency rooms and an urgent-care centre in the city of Winnipeg, including closing down the emergency room at Concordia Hospital.

(2) The closures come on the heels of the closing of nearby QuickCare clinics, as well as cancelled plans for ACCESS centres and personal-care homes, such as Park Manor, that would have provided important services for families and seniors in our area.

(3) The closures have left families and seniors in northeast Winnipeg without any point of contact with the front-line health-care services and will result in them having to travel 20 minutes or more to St. Boniface Hospital's emergency room for emergency care.

(4) These cuts will place a heavy burden on the many seniors who live in northeast Winnipeg and visit the emergency room frequently, especially for those who are unable to drive or are low income.

(5) The provincial government failed to consult with families and seniors in northeast Winnipeg regarding the closing of their emergency room or to consult with health officials and health-care workers at Concordia to discuss how this closure would impact patient care in advance of the announcement.

We petition the Legislative Assembly of Manitoba as follows:

To urge the provincial government to reverse the decision to close Concordia Hospital's emergency room so that families and seniors in northeast Winnipeg and the surrounding areas have timely access to quality health services.

And this petition is signed by many Manitobans. Thank you, Madam Speaker.

**Madam Speaker:** Grievances?

### **ORDERS OF THE DAY GOVERNMENT BUSINESS**

**Hon. Kelvin Goertzen (Government House Leader):** As agreed upon, in consultations with the parties in this House and independent members, we would like to consider condolence motions this afternoon.

**Madam Speaker:** It has been announced that the House will consider condolence motions this afternoon.

### **MOTIONS OF CONDOLENCE**

#### **Frank Johnston**

**Hon. Brian Pallister (Premier):** Colleagues, I'm moving, seconded by the member from St. James, that the House convey to the family of the late Frank Johnston, who served as a member of the Legislative Assembly of Manitoba, its sincere sympathy in their bereavement and its appreciation of his devotion to duty in a useful life of active community and public service, and that, Madam Speaker, be requested to forward a copy of this resolution to the family.

*Motion presented.*

**Mr. Pallister:** Madam Speaker, I consider it a tremendous honour to have the chance to offer condolences to the family and to the many, many friends of J. Frank today in this House.

As I rise to remember Frank, I am reminded that life is a series of seasons. And such was the case for J. Frank. He was a legislator, a business leader, a husband, father, grandfather, community volunteer and an upstanding Manitoban who earned the respect of those he came into contact with. He demonstrated a strong love and commitment to community service. He was an alderman and deputy mayor in St. James from 1964 to 1972. And as a Progressive Conservative MLA, he served from 1969 right 'til 1988, Madam Speaker. He served in Sterling Lyon's government as the minister responsible for the Manitoba Housing and Renewal Corporation, the Minister of Economic Development and Tourism.

He attended St. John's College. He was the past president of the Assiniboine Golf Club. He was the member of the St. Charles Country Club and the member of the Sturgeon Creek Masonic Lodge.

J. Frank, along with his wife Hazel, established and operated a successful family business, JFJ Agency, for many, many years. It is a wonderful example, Madam Speaker, of one's family's legacy of service that it is being carried forward, and it's being carried forward by Frank's son, the member for St. James (Mr. Johnston).

And I know that the member for St. James is tremendously proud, as we all are, of his father's legacy. Indeed, the MLA for St. James said a couple of years ago, Madam Speaker, and I quote: My father's commitment to representing the people who showed the confidence in him truly inspires me to do the same.

He was not known to mince words, to put it mildly, Madam Speaker, when describing his political opponents or their positions. There was never any doubt about where J. Frank Johnston stood on an issue. He would never have fit into the category of a scripted legislator.

His grandson Bryce, who's with us in the gallery today, has described him, I think, quite accurately as the perfect politician. He cared deeply for his community; he cheered for the underdog; and he was immensely proud to be a Manitoban. He exemplified this pride by continually wearing a bison lapel pin, Madam Speaker. He could be fiercely partisan.

In fact, the bison pin was a story told at the celebration of Frank's life, was sometimes used, I believe, to repudiate his position with respect to New Democratic Party policies. If he had to meet or have a discussion with a member of what he would sometimes lovingly refer to as the socialist party, he would turn the bison upside down, perhaps to reflect his thoughts on how they were governing at the time.

Frank was also a determined planner and he exuded this trait right up until the end. Bryce noted that in his latter days, when he was confined to hospital, he confided that he was planning to break out, and he was, despite his broken ankle, very sure that he would be able to climb stairs in order to do so.

It was also his fervent hope to take his wife out to their beloved St. Charles for another dinner. Holidays, family occasions: very, very important to the man, and for many years he transformed himself, Madam Speaker, into Santa Claus. In particular, his work as Jolly St. Nick was especially appreciated by those who visited the Mount Carmel Clinic; in particular, children.

Christmas was his favourite time of the year, and his joy was evident to all those around him. It's been noted that the sheer number of Christmas lights around the Johnston home was a source of great joy for the family and for those around that neighbourhood as well, and there were certainly stories shared about certain installations of Christmas lights at a celebration we attended recently.

To the Johnston family, we extend our love, we extend our prayers and we extend our gratitude. Thank you for sharing J. Frank with the people of Manitoba and for the sense of service and commitment that the whole family carries forthwith.

Manitoba is a better place because of J. Frank Johnston, and may we all copy his example and be genuine public servants, carrying out the will of people and seeking to improve their condition.

God bless the memory of J. Frank Johnston.

**Mr. Scott Johnston (St. James):** It's an honour to be here to speak on this occasion, not only on behalf of my father but to recognize all of the other distinguished members who have passed on.

I'd like to take the opportunity to thank the Premier (Mr. Pallister) for his kind words and his true and genuine support of one of his colleagues when my dad passed away on February 17th, somewhat unexpectedly.

\* (14:50)

It's very difficult, as I'm sure other people can appreciate who have had losses within their own families, but the Premier was extremely supportive, as well as my colleagues in the House, and also, too, the members across were also, too, very sympathetic in their condolences to me. So I do want to extend that appreciation to all. Sometimes we're all human beings and non-partisanship is truly there, so I do appreciate everyone's support.

I would like to recognize our family who is here today, with the Speaker's permission. My mother Hazel is here, my sister Robyn, my wife Karen, my nephew Bryce Matlashewski and my brother-in-law Eugene Matlashewski.

My dad was a self-made man. His father passed away when he was 16 years old. Dad had a very supportive grandfather who was also a—who was a St. James city councillor. That's where my father were—first had his exposure to community service.

Over time, Dad developed his own work ethic and passed that down to his children.

Dad cherished many things in his life: his family, his community and most of all, his wife Hazel, whom he adored. They were a team right from the beginning and shared a full life over their 66 years of marriage. They were still going on weekly dates, as the Premier (Mr. Pallister) had indicated, and they loved their New Year's Eve; they were always the last people on the dance floor. They were an inspiration to us all of what a relationship really is.

When Mom and Dad were first married, he was a salesman for Paulin-Chambers biscuits. He took a transfer to Regina, and Mom took a job with the Saskatchewan government. Dad used to tell stories of the great times they used to have back then.

They joined the local curling club and golf clubs and chummed with a member of the—members of the Saskatchewan Roughriders. His Saskatchewan Roughie buddies knew that he had played football in school and suggested he try out for the team. Well, anyone who knows my dad knows that he was never intimidated by anything in life. After he tried out, he would relay to everyone that he was the best tackling prop that the Roughriders had ever known. But that was Dad; he wasn't 'afried'—afraid to try, and that's what he instilled in his children.

Mom and Dad came back to Winnipeg and worked in sales in the plumbing and heating business. At that stage, they started their family: my sisters Robyn and Donna, as well as myself.

Dad determined that he should be paying himself and then started his own business in the industry.

Mom and Dad made their decisions together. In 1961, Dad was asked to run as an alderman in the old city of St. James. Mom worked typing his endorsement cards, and Dad did what he did best, and that was communicating with people.

Dad became a member of the St. James City Council and served as deputy mayor from '64 to '69.

Dad had a way with people and they genuinely liked him, and he loved his roots in St. James. He cherished his community, and he took such pride in his involvement in the building of the Grace Hospital as well as the St. James Civic Centre, which he considered one of his legacies. He is honoured to have plaques in both those places, acknowledging his contribution, with the other members of council.

He was so proud to have been one of the architects of the St. James industrial area. Dad firmly believed that the opportunity to create a business environment within a community, as long as it didn't infringe on the community, was a very positive thing because the taxes they contributed to that community would offset community costs as well as all of the other essentials that a community has. So he took great pride in—along city council—it's that northern area of St. James, at the end of Century, et cetera, that was all sort of planned, just for that result, and he was very proud of that.

In 1969, Premier Walter Weir approached Dad to run provincially in the new constituency of Sturgeon Creek. Sturgeon Creek is currently divided into Kirkfield Park, St. James and Assiniboia.

Mom oversaw the family business when Dad ran in the provincial election. The government was defeated by the Schreyer government—

**An Honourable Member:** Hear, hear.

**Mr. Johnston:** I knew that would get some applause from the other side.

However, Dad won the Sturgeon Creek seat in a tight race, and Walter Weir had said on that night, thank goodness for J. Frank, as he was one of the only bright spots during that election. He won a tight see-saw battle all night with Liberal Bob Chipman, and Dad always—Bob and Dad became very good friends and Dad continued to take credit why Bob Chipman wound up being one of the most successful businessmen in Manitoba.

Dad didn't mind a fight, being in opposition to do what he enjoyed, challenging the government on behalf of his beloved community, and Dad didn't mind giving a lecture whether you wanted to hear it or not. Dad served as caucus chair for a lot of his tenure—most of his tenure, and he had a reputation for being fiercely loyal to his colleagues and caucus.

He was well liked and respected by his friends in the political arena on both sides of the House. For various party leaderships, he was asked to nominate different members or different candidates—the legendary Harry Enns, who was a good friend of his; Sterling Lyon, who became Premier; and Clayton Manness, who was also a very good friend of his.

He was proud to serve in Sterling Lyon's government as a Cabinet minister, Housing and Renewal, Economic Development, Responsible for

Small Business, as well as Tourism, and he very much—he wasn't part of Gary Filmon's government, but he very much enjoyed following their success, and also, too, he was asked to consult on many occasions.

I'm so pleased—I—he was so pleased that he was able to see the Pallister government win, in particular due to the fact that I was part of that success. It was something that our whole family was able to share because our—there's one thing about our family: we didn't lack knowledge of politics growing up.

He followed the legislative proceedings all his life and, in retirement, he would periodically ask how that kid that used to deliver his pamphlets in Sturgeon Creek was doing, and I would indicate that the Deputy Premier is doing an excellent job.

My friends affectionately gave Dad the nickname Bigfoot, because when they were downstairs in our basement they could hear him periodically walking towards the fridge, and that pounding you couldn't ignore.

It always made me feel proud the way my friends thought of Dad. They all respected him and found him to be a gentle—a genuine man as well as a true gentleman.

Dad was never afraid to jump into things. I remember when we got our first boat. It was a second-hand boat with very limited power, and Dad was determined to water ski with us. He always said that one of the reasons he liked Clear Lake so much was because he swallowed so much of that water. But he did get up, and that was part of his foundation of saying you've got to try.

Dad, at our cabin, was a very—good fun and loving time for Dad and the family. We always—he always accommodated our family as well as friends and certainly hosted neighbours. Our quarters were very small, but Dad's heart was so big, and we have plenty of memories from our cabin.

I will miss Dad's breakfasts at the lake. He loved to cook a big breakfast for everybody on the weekends, and we could always depend on Dad.

I have very fond memories of our discussions around the dining room table. We used to talk about everything from politics to social reform to sports, and Dad loved to hold court on that table and he loved a good fight around that table, I can tell you.

Our dad was always there for us through thick and thin. He was always first and foremost a family

man, and he loved celebrating the successes as well as helping us meet our challenges. He always made a special effort to attend his grandchildren's activities too.

I learned so much from my father. His business relationships were strong and ones of integrity and trust. He loved the relationship he had with his business suppliers. It's heartwarming to hear how much they liked and respected him. The words that are always associated with my dad is, your dad was a gentleman.

\*(15:00)

He enjoyed doing business right up to the—right up until he passed away, and I'm sure that's one of the reasons that, at 87, his mind was always sharp.

I not only had a father-son relationship with my dad, I worked with him in business and we shared an interest in politics. And we were friends. I admired him so much. His commitment to his community has inspired myself and my sisters all my life—all our lives. His love and support for my sisters and I was unrelenting and his love for my mother was always forefront. And he always treated her like the lady she is.

When you leave this world, you like to think you made a difference and I can honestly say my dad did.

I thank you.

Madam Speaker, I don't think I've shaken so many hands since the election.

**Madam Speaker:** The honourable member for St. James?

**Mr. Johnston:** Oh, sorry, Madam Speaker. I was just commenting, I don't think I've shaken so many hands since the last election. Thank you all.

**Mr. Andrew Swan (Minto):** Madam Speaker, it's an honour on behalf of our NDP caucus to put some words on the record about the life of J. Frank Johnston, who was the MLA for Sturgeon Creek from 1969 to 1998 and, as a result, was my family's MLA. My parents moved on to Bruce Avenue in Silver Heights in 1969, the year that he was elected. And I lived in that house all the way through 1988, when Mr. Johnston's political career ended.

Mr. Johnston was a true pillar of the community in St. James. As we've heard, he was a former alderman in the old city of St. James from 1964 to 1966. He was also an alderman in the successor city of St. James-Assiniboia from 1968 through to 1972.

Mr. Johnston was chosen as St. James deputy mayor in 1968 and also chaired the urban renewal committee.

As we know from his time in this Legislature, he was only in government for four years, but it's fair to say that he made the most of his four years on the government side. Mr. Johnston was appointed the minister responsible for Manitoba Housing and Renewal Corporation for the first year of the term. For the next year, he served as the Minister of Economic Development, and then served as the minister in the revised department of minister and economic—Minister of Economic Development and Tourism.

I want to thank the Premier (Mr. Pallister) for his eloquent words today, and I, certainly, want to pay condolences and also acknowledge the words of my friends, the member for St. James (Mr. Johnston). We have known each other a long time. As some of you know, I delivered papers to the member for St. James' house on McLaughlin Avenue.

*Mr. Doyle Pivniuk, Deputy Speaker, in the Chair*

But above that, above and beyond that—look, everybody in St. James knew where J. Frank Johnston lived. He and his family lived at the corner of Overdale and Bruce in a beautiful house, and, if you know St. James at all, you know that Overdale is a—it's a beautiful street. It's actually a double street, lined with the beautiful trees. And, for those of us who lived up Bruce Avenue, that was actually where you turned if you were going to Assiniboine Park or if you wanted to get onto the trails on either side of the river.

And what really struck me when Mr. Johnston passed away, from connections in St. James, from some of the stories that were told by the member and others—as a parent, you always want to be the parent whose house your kids' friends gather at. That's, I think, what most parents would like to maybe be their immediate legacy is that their kids' friends come over. And what was immediately apparent, and from what I know about St. James, is that was the Johnston household. And I know a lot of the member for St. James friends and a lot of the friends of his siblings had that to say, that the Johnston house at the corner of Overdale and Bruce was the place where they would gather.

I'm sure they would have political discussions. I'm sure they'd have all kinds of discussion in their house, but Mr. Johnston and his wife built a home,

and a home where his—not just his children but his children's friends felt very, very comfortable in attending. And that, beyond—above and beyond anything else that might have been said or accomplished in this Legislature, might be the biggest legacy of all.

Now, with respect to Mr. Johnston, I think the Premier—you know, the Premier and I don't always agree on everything, if people had noticed, but what is absolutely agreeable is that Mr. Johnston was somebody who spoke his mind. And it was very, very clear that he did not like the New Democratic Party, which came through most of his speeches in this House and also in the community, and he made it very clear, and you knew exactly where you stood.

And, growing up, I don't recall actually ever having any face-to-face meetings with Mr. Johnston until election night, 1990. Frank had been defeated in the 1988 election. In 1990, as a 22-year-old articling student at a law firm, I ran for the NDP. Spoiler alert: I didn't win. But I did go over to Gerry McAlpine's campaign office on Portage Avenue to offer my congratulations, and the first person who greeted me at the door was J. Frank Johnston. And he shook my hand and he looked at me, and he said, well, you seem like a fine young man. I'm sure one day you're going to be running for the Progressive Conservative Party.

And, before my 22-year-old self, which probably was a lot more intemperate than my very mellow 50-year-old self, could respond, actually, the member for St. James stepped in and, I believe, found an errand for his father to do elsewhere in the campaign office, and we actually had a really good conversation, which I still remember 28 years after the fact.

And I took J. Frank Johnston's line as a compliment or, at the very least, the biggest compliment I could expect to get from the man as a kid growing up in St. James.

So, on behalf of our NDP caucus but also on behalf of a family that grew up in St. James—and if my mom is watching this, as she's able because of the arrangements that have been made, my mom would still want you and your family to know she never voted for your dad. But, on behalf of this St. James family and also my family on this side of the Legislature, certainly, I want to wish all the best to the member for St. James but also to the family who is here today.

Thank you, Mr. Deputy Speaker.

\* (15:10)

**Hon. Jon Gerrard (River Heights):** Yes, Mr. Speaker, I would like to extend condolences to the member for St. James (Mr. Johnston) and to the family members who are here, on behalf of the Liberal caucus. It's clear that J. Frank Johnston was well known and well respected. He was a man who made significant contributions to St. James, including the St. James Civic Centre, having a role in its being developed and put in place, and in the St. James Industrial Park, as also making significant contributions as a minister here in the government from '77 to '81.

And it's pretty clear that his contributions as minister of housing—and Economic Development and Tourism, you know, were a part of his legacy and something which can be remembered now as we continue to talk about efforts that are needed in economic development and in tourism. He contributed not just in the political arena, but clearly with his family, his friends and his neighbours, his home being a gathering place. He cared for children, not only the neighbours' children, but children around the city as Santa Claus at Mount Carmel Clinic and at the YMCA.

We have a lot to be thankful for and I offer my deepest sympathy on behalf of our caucus to the MLA for St. James.

**Hon. Heather Stefanson (Minister of Families):** Mr. Deputy Speaker, I'm honoured to rise in the House today to speak to this condolence motion as a—and I just want to welcome the Johnston family, who's here with us today, in particular, Hazel and Robyn, Karen, Eugene, Bryce. Welcome to all of you.

And I also just want to say that in my 18 years of being here, I don't think I've ever had the opportunity to hear from—a son speak about his father on a condolence motion. And so this is a first for me, and I was very moved to be a part of that. And you should all be very proud of your son and brother and husband.

You know, my family, Mr. Deputy Speaker, goes way back with the Johnston family and—many, many years. And I can recall first meeting Hazel and J. Frank on a campaign that my father ran in, in 1977. And they were both friends of Sterling Lyon, and my father wasn't quite as successful in politics at that time. He ran in Fort Rouge. He didn't win

the election, but I can recall at the time he had tremendous support from J. Frank, from Hazel and their family at the time. And so it was an honour for me to be able to spend time with J. Frank and see and learn from him, from his incredible values that he has for—as a Manitoban and a distinguished Manitoban.

J. Frank certainly was well-known in the St. James community. He loved his community. And I know that my husband's family grew up in St. James. My husband grew up in St. James, lived there on Flamingo Avenue, fairly close to—close by where J. Frank and his family lived. And they got to know each other very well over the years as well. And they were big supporters of J. Frank over the years.

And I know that J. Frank and Hazel had a long-standing date. It was date night every Friday at St. Charles Country Club and it was wonderful to see them there from time to time and have them celebrate their 66 years of marriage. And that should be commended. And I thank Hazel for being here today.

I think J. Frank, for everything that he was—the incredible politician, the statesman, the representative from St. James—actually, Sturgeon Creek at the time. He was really a family man, though. He loved his family very much. He loved his wife, Hazel. He loved his children, his grandchildren. And it was really his family that meant everything to him.

And so, you know, I want to just say today that—on behalf of the Stefanson family, on behalf of my family, the McDonald family, I extend our deepest condolences to you all. We will very much miss a wonderful statement—statesman, a wonderful Manitoban, a wonderful Canadian in J. Frank Johnston.

Thank you.

**Hon. Steven Fletcher (Assiniboia):** Mr. Chair, before I begin, on March 22nd, 2017 I made a statement, a member statement, about J. Frank and I wonder, with unanimous consent, if we could include that statement in the Hansard of the proceedings of this afternoon. Therefore, I ask for unanimous consent.

**Mr. Deputy Speaker:** Is there leave for the House to consider the statement in the Hansard? [*Agreed*]

*Madam Speaker, today we honour a great father, entrepreneur and public servant. J. Frank Johnston,*

*former MLA and provincial Cabinet minister, passed away last month.*

*Janice Cook, a friend of the family, reminds us, for many of us who grew up in St. James, the Johnston home was a home away from home. She continues to say on behalf of the many of us teenage brats that just wouldn't go away, we thank you, Mr. J., for the many memories you allowed us to have in your home. Friend, Mike Mooney said, J. Frank was the perfect gentleman—classy, great sense of humor, and a man of his word.*

*This remarkable man served as deputy mayor of the municipality of St. James and served four terms as an MLA. A few of his successful projects included the Grace Hospital, the Assiniboine Golf Club, Sturgeon Creek Masonic Temple and the St. James Civic Centre.*

*But perhaps J. Frank's most remarkable and long-lasting legacy is his family. Public service can have a heavy price on a family. J. Frank's life partner of 66 years, Hazel, and he had a symbiotic relationship. Each built on the other's strengths, and each supported each other in tough times. Together, they raised three kids, Robyn, Scott and Donna, in their home in St. James.*

*Our colleague, a chip off the old block, member for St. James (Mr. Johnston) can be proud of his father, as he was proud of his children and life partner.*

*Thank you for everything, J. Frank.*

**Mr. Fletcher:** Thank you, Mr. Chair, and I think the Johnston family and Frank—J. Frank—would appreciate that there was unanimous consent to have Hansard included in this proceeding. They're probably one of the few families around that would understand what just happened then.

The fact that J. Frank has left a legacy—substantial legacy, both through family and politics, is significant. I will simply say that when you do a member statement, you have 60 seconds, and I will try and say a little bit more than what was said then because you can't put a whole life in 60 seconds.

When I ran for federal office in Charleswood-St. James-Assiniboia-Headingley, the constituency that J. Frank represented, enclosed in that space and certainly anyone who wanted to be successful in politics needed to talk to J. Frank so they'd be aware of who he was and his family and so on, but it wasn't until 2016 when I really go to know J. Frank Johnston at a different level and, in part, that's

probably because it's a little intimidating to talk to someone that you've heard their name for your adult life.

And I remembered very distinctly being at a fundraising event after the election with the member from St. James. It was the Silver Heights restaurant; there was probably 50 or so people there, but what was striking was that J. Frank Johnston was there, the member for St. James (Mr. Johnston), and their whole family—Hazel, the sisters, the nephews. In fact, I may have been the only non-Johnston there as far as I could tell. But he was such a friendly man, and in the obituary in the Free Press people left comments and I would like to take a moment to read a couple of those comments.

\* (15:20)

Leslie Hutchings reflects that people would come together at the Johnston home. That was the go-to place, apparently, in St. James.

Jackie Dragojevic tells us that it was a sudden thing but has wonderful memories over 50 years at Clear Lake and the campground and—I don't think I can say that, but it was very touching.

There's one by Donna Harrowen. So many memories of hanging out at the Johnstons, from the time when we were wee ones through our teenage years and into our young adult. I can't share them all, but the time—by the time we'd destroyed the backyard with our mud waterslides and J. Frank came out—home, and, boy, did we get in trouble. But we were always welcomed back. Playing on the pipes in the basement like they were monkey bars, Christmas Eve in the dining room, J. Frank getting me up to dance the polka—trying to visualize that for a moment—his good-natured teasing, many meals, many sleepovers, many memories. We knew the Johnston home as we knew our own houses.

There are many statements like this, and perhaps it's best to simply table these comments. But Janice Cook, who is now Janice Cook Currier, left these words. For many of us that grew up in St. James, the Johnston home was our home away from home. It was our gathering place, a place of laughter, and we—where we all explored our teenage years together. Constant memories, beautiful home, and Hazel—were very special and very patient. It's amazing—you'd think about the continuum of life and the impact the Johnston family had, just not in politics and not even the family but, obviously, the people of the community. And that's what it's really about.



So, with that, appreciate the Premier's (Mr. Pallister) remarks and the Minister of Families' (Mrs. Stefanson) and the remarks from the member from River Heights and the member for Minto (Mr. Swan). You're—the member for St. James (Mr. Johnston), you have big shoes to fill from a great family. Sorry about your loss, but, as you said, in your own remarks, life well lived is a life worthwhile, and a life that makes the community better is a good one.

So thank you to the member of St. James.  
*[inaudible]*

**Mr. Deputy Speaker:** Is there any further speakers?

Is it the pleasure of the House to adopt the—this motion? *[Agreed]*

Would the honourable members please rise and remain standing to indicate their support for the motion?

*A moment of silence was observed.*

**Mr. Deputy Speaker:** Please be seated.

**Howard R. Pawley**

**Mr. Deputy Speaker:** Now we'll move on to the next motion.

**Hon. Colleen Mayer (Minister of Crown Services):** I move, seconded by the member for Minto, that the House convey to the family of the late Howard R. Pawley, who served as member of the Legislative Assembly of Manitoba, its sincere sympathy in their bereavement and its appreciation for his devotion to duty in a useful life of active community and public service, and that Madam Speaker be requested to forward a copy of this resolution to the family.

*Motion presented.*

**Mr. Andrew Swan (Minto):** It's an honour to speak today in memory of Howard Pawley, the former MLA for Selkirk, former Attorney General of Manitoba and the 18th premier of Manitoba.

Howard was born in Brampton, Ontario, in 1934 and moved to Winnipeg with his family in 1952 when his father sold the family farm and took a job as a sales manager. His family moved onto Ingersoll Street in the heart of the West End. Howard graduated from Daniel McIntyre Collegiate, as it turned out, just one year before my dad did. They didn't know each other, as far as I know. Howard

would have been a much more serious student than my dad ever was.

In 1953, after finishing high school, Howard received his teaching certificate from the Manitoba normal school and began his working career as a teacher at South Plympton School in the rural municipality of Springfield. Howard then attended United College, the forerunner of the University of Winnipeg, receiving a bachelor of arts in 1957. That same year, he was elected president of the Manitoba CCF, becoming, at the age of 23, the youngest president in the party's history. Also that year, Howard first ran for public office in the 1957 Canadian federal election as the CCF candidate in the riding of Lisgar, which I believe is still a developing riding in our books, and finished fourth.

In the Manitoba 1958 provincial election, he ran in the northern riding of The Pas and finished third. And at the same time as he served as the CCF party president, he studied law at the University of Manitoba where he received his bachelor of law. After graduation, he began practising law in Stonewall, working out of a small office in the basement of the Stonewall Credit Union and later moving his practice to Selkirk.

In the 1965 federal election, he ran in the Selkirk riding, finishing third.

Howard was finally elected. He was elected to represent Selkirk in the Manitoba Legislature in 1969 in the historic election which saw Manitoba's first NDP government. What some members may not know is that Howard was actually involved in a serious car accident just weeks before the election was called, and he had to be convinced by Ed Schreyer to actually put his name on the ballot.

Despite being confined to the hospital for most of the campaign, Howard was elected due partly to the rising popularity of his party, but what most people who knew Howard would say, due to the campaigning and the efforts of his wife, Adele.

Howard was re-elected by the people of Selkirk in 1973, 1977, 1981 and again in 1986. Howard was chosen to be part of Ed Schreyer's Cabinet in 1969. He became minister of Government Services and minister of Municipal Affairs on July 15, 1969. Although he stood down as minister of Government Services later that year, he remained the Municipal Affairs minister until September 22, 1976.

In 1973, Howard was also appointed Attorney General and, in 1976, he was given the additional

responsibility of administering The Liquor Control Act until the 1977 election.

In 1979, Howard replaced Ed Schreyer as leader of the provincial NDP after Ed Schreyer was appointed as Canada's Governor General. Howard was initially elected interim leader by the party caucus and later defeated Muriel Smith and Russ Doern at the subsequent leadership convention in 1979.

In the 1981 election, the NDP, led by Pawley, defeated the Progressive Conservative government of Sterling Lyon, which was, in fact, the first time in the province's history that any party had ever been voted out of office after serving only one term.

\*(15:30)

Howard was sworn in as premier of Manitoba on November 30, 1981 and served until the government fell in the spring of 1988. Following 1988, Howard joined the law firm of Baker Zivot and, in 1990, he returned to his roots in Ontario to become an associate professor of political science at the University of Windsor. He also served as the Stanley Knowles professor at the University of Waterloo and as a visiting professor in Canadian studies at the University of Washington in Seattle.

In 2000, he was awarded the Order of Manitoba, and in 2001, he was made an Officer of the Order of Canada. Howard was awarded the Distinguished Alumni Award from the University of Winnipeg in 2008.

Howard served as vice-president of the Canadian Civil Liberties Association, as an executive member of the Public Interest Advocacy Centre, as chair of the Harry Crowe Foundation and as vice-president of the Canadian Broadcast Standards Council. He was also a board member of the Erie St. Clair Local Health Integration Network.

Howard passed away in Windsor on December 30, 2015. Flags not only at the Manitoba Legislature but also at the Windsor City Hall flew at half-mast.

Howard was married to Adele for 55 years before his passing. He's also survived by his son Chris, who still lives in Manitoba, and his daughter Charysse, who lives in Ontario, and their—and seven grandchildren.

Now, Howard was soft spoken and gentle; there's no question about that. But a look at various events in his career shows that he was a tenacious

fighter for things he believed in and was, in many ways, a truly ahead of his time.

Following the 1969 election, Howard chaired a committee that brought forward public auto insurance legislation for the province. He introduced the legislation, served as both the first chairperson and the first minister responsible for MPIC, from 1971 until 1973. Make no mistake, Mr. Deputy Speaker, bringing in public auto insurance in Manitoba was a big fight. The insurance industry, which feared the loss of profits, and Manitoba's insurance brokers, who were uncertain what their business model would be with public auto insurance, opposed the creation of public auto insurance.

And in the book written by Howard Pawley, called *Keep True*, which I'm happy to loan to anybody in this Chamber who'd like to borrow it, Howard had some comments on what that debate was all about. And he said that in May—page 42—on the 12th of May, 1970, I introduced the second reading of Bill 56. I did not shy from striking back at the ideological campaign of the opposition. I pointed out that certain segments in society with vested interests had always fought every progressive measure, including medicare, Canada Pension Plan and hospital insurance. I demonstrated their predictions of gloom and doom had always proved to be exaggerated.

He then went on to say, I demonstrated to the Legislature that the advantages of a public plan included a return of 85 per cent of the premiums collected from motorists in claim benefits, representing a savings of one half of the administrative costs presently incurred under private plans. Earnings from the investments would be used to reduce premiums or to increase benefits. There'd be uniformity in coverage and administration for all Manitoba motorists by the creation of one public agency which would be sensitive to public needs. I explained that a compulsory auto insurance plan was comparable to a public utility and that claim service centres throughout the province would facilitate economical and efficient claim adjusting services. This plan would provide reasonable limits on basic protections for all Manitobans, with the right of motorists to obtain additional supplementary coverage. The Crown corporation could also supply supplementary insurance on a competitive basis. Moreover, I explained, provincial insurance corporations have every political reason to reduce accidents and claims by insisting on safer driving conditions for their motorists. No discrimination in

rates based on age or sex would be assessed to the motorists. Bad drivers would be surcharged additional dollars on the driver's permits because that is the fairest way.

And it was a tough fight. There was a massive protest, or rally, depending how you looked at it, on the Legislative grounds, opposed to MPIC, which, in fact, was, the—at the time, the largest protest or rally that had ever happened at the Legislature. But Howard remained true, kept true, as his biography would say, and Manitoba obtained public auto insurance. And I would suggest, although perhaps others may disagree, that Howard was proved right. Public auto insurance has saved Manitobans billions of dollars of premiums, much of which would've left the province and into the hands of the shareholders of insurance companies. But it also, equally important, remained possible for insurance brokers, and also body shops who do the work, to thrive and also made it possible for young drivers from modest households to be able to afford to drive.

As Attorney General, he introduced amendments to Manitoba's human rights legislation to protect Manitobans against discrimination because of a physical or mental disability. It's hard to imagine a time in our province's history when those protections didn't exist.

He also protected Manitobans against discrimination because of their political beliefs. And he had, unfortunately in his family, personal experience when his wife Adele's employment was threatened by her boss because of her involvement in the then-CCF.

And the amendments that Howard made also took away the mandatory age of retirement, which allowed people to continue working if they felt healthy and able, or financially needed to do so.

Howard also moved ahead towards the end of the second term of the Schreyer government, to move ahead on advancing family law legislation. And what—at that time, in the 1970s, there was no guarantee that, upon marriage breakdown, that one spouse—usually the wife—who may not have been in the workforce, who may have been the homemaker, who may have given up opportunities, would receive any share of property. And various cases decided by the Supreme Court of Canada—farm cases—actually held against women making a claim after a long-term marriage had broken down. And Howard, pushed by some very, very strong women within the NDP, moved ahead with groundbreaking changes to The

Marital Property Act in 1977. And it was, again, a very, very difficult debate in this House. The interesting part is that, at the end of the day, New Democrats voted for the changes. But even some of the opposition members, particularly those who lived in the city who listened to people who came to committee hearings, who listened to the lobbying they were getting in their own communities or who, perhaps, just—because it was almost all men in this Legislature—heard about it at home, actually voted in support of these changes to The Family Maintenance Act, which is a tremendous achievement by Howard.

Now, after Howard became premier in 1981, there was one of the most difficult times in the Manitoba Legislature. And the issue of French language rights became a huge issue in Manitoba. Following a court decision here in Manitoba, it became clear that the laws that had been passed in Manitoba in 1890 to take away rights from francophones in Manitoba, that that was wrong. And it was unclear exactly what was going to happen. The previous government had put in place remedial legislation which was almost immediately challenged by another Manitoban.

And Howard and his government could have—and politically by any objective standard probably should have—simply awaited another decision from the Supreme Court of Canada and blamed the court or blamed the previous government. Instead, the government of Howard Pawley entered into negotiations to try to prevent the case from going to the Supreme Court of Canada, and they introduced legislation to extend French language rights as they had been advised was going to happen if the case went to court. And that set off a firestorm which, as legislators now—I think it's probably difficult to even imagine.

Today, Winnipeggers will be voting on a plebiscite on whether or not to open Portage and Main to traffic. Well, more than 30 years ago, Winnipeggers and Manitobans in many other municipalities, held plebiscites on whether to extend French language services as was likely to happen in the courts. Every single one of those plebiscites was defeated, and the NDP government became wildly unpopular, falling at one point to 12 per cent in the polls.

The opposition used rules—or, perhaps, the lack of rules at that time—because they smelled blood and believed this was the right thing to do for their purposes and actually forced the government to

withdraw proposed legislation and come back with a watered-down proposal the next session. And, although it appeared that the Pawley government would be the second government to only serve one term before being voted out, and even though they lost seats in the 1986 provincial election, Howard's government was re-elected in 1986 by a narrow majority.

Soon after being re-elected, there was another major issue that arose in which Howard truly was able to reach across political lines and also some traditional fault lines that have existed in this province. For political reasons, late in 1986 the federal government awarded a major contract for CF-18 fighters to a Quebec-based firm instead of Bristol Aerospace. And at that time, Howard—despite, of course, usually being at war with Conservatives in Manitoba and also premiers across the west who might have a different ideology, and sometimes the business community actually found himself on the same side and working together on a coalition.

\* (15:40)

And Howard led a delegation to travel to Ottawa to meet with the Prime Minister, which included Mayor Norrie, including officials from Bristol Aerospace, but also included both Chamber of Commerce and labour leaders to try to convince the Prime Minister to actually let the winning bid be the best bid, which was the one put forward by Bristol Aerospace.

We know, I think, how that story ended. Howard and the unified forces in Manitoba were unsuccessful. It, frankly, led to the creation of the Reform Party, as many people in the West were frustrated with the national government.

Perhaps the main thing we can take away from that is we move from beyond, sometimes, the purely partisan things that we do every day, that sometimes we do have to speak together as a smaller province, and sometimes as a smaller province that sometimes has to lead other smaller provinces in picking our fights well, but when we do, speaking with one voice in dealing with the federal government.

Now, one of the things that Howard, perhaps, has gotten very little credit for that I want to highlight today as we continue to follow the path to reconciliation, it's that Howard was far and away ahead of his time, and I just want to highlight a

couple of pieces of evidence to demonstrate just how clear that was.

First of all, it was Howard who convinced Elijah Harper to become involved in provincial politics, and we know that Elijah Harper wound up playing a very, very pivotal role with respect to Meech Lake in his career.

We also know that Elijah Harper went on to serve as a Member of Parliament for Manitoba's northern seat.

It was also Howard who, as the Attorney General, established a model for Aboriginal self-policing, and, because of Howard's support and desire in the community, the Dakota Ojibway Police Service was created. That's a police service, DOPS, which I know the Minister of Justice (Mr. Cullen) is familiar with. I've had the chance to work with, which is a tremendous police force which is by and for people living in First Nations communities across southern Manitoba.

It was also Howard who was the lone premier who spoke about the need to support Aboriginal self-government during four First Ministers' conferences on Aboriginal constitutional matters from 1983 until 1987, first with Prime Minister Trudeau, and then with Prime Minister Mulroney.

It was not a very popular or an easy position to take in the '80s, and in negotiations for the Meech Lake Accord it was Howard who played a fair but firm role in trying to protect the rights of indigenous people.

I know what it's like to be the only New Democrat walking into a room, a federal-provincial meeting. Howard and his Cabinet members filled that role, and I'm very proud, actually, of the positions they took.

He was also a practical support for indigenous people. When the Limestone hydro dam was built, it was Howard who made sure there were guarantees for indigenous workers in the construction of that dam and, again, that was not an easy or, frankly, a popular decision for government to make, but it was the right thing to do and Howard did it.

It was also a connection on a personal level, and Steve Paikin, who's a reporter with TV Ontario, well, he wrote about the eulogy that Mr. Justice Murray Sinclair, who'd recently concluded his work as Chair of the Truth and Reconciliation Commission, delivered at Howard's memorial in Windsor soon

after he passed away. And Mr. Justice Sinclair spoke about the profound influence that Howard had on his life, because it was Howard who hired Mr. Justice Sinclair to be his executive assistant and who convinced him to go to law school, and it was the Pawley government that appointed Mr. Justice Sinclair to the Provincial Court of Manitoba, which was the start of a tremendous and a greatly successful judicial career.

*Madam Speaker in the Chair*

And Mr. Justice Sinclair, in his comments at Howard's memorial, also noted seeing him, by then in his 80s, out on the street demonstrating against federal Bill C-51, holding a picket sign and demonstrating and calling for the controversial security bill's repeal.

Sinclair, then in his mid-60s, joked: That's who I want to be when I get old.

So there were many other things, and there's one more I want to speak to. Everybody knows, I believe, that the government of Howard Pawley fell in 1988 when Jim Walding, who was a disgruntled backbencher, voted against the budget, but I just want to read the very last section before the epilogue in Howard's book on page 256.

Less than 12 hours after the—that fatal vote, a lone bullet from police officer Robert Cross's revolver would fatally wound Aboriginal leader J.J. Harper. Cross had stopped Harper as a suspect in a stolen car incident, even though the police had already arrested the two teenagers responsible. One of the final acts of our government was thus the appointment of the Aboriginal Justice Inquiry. The recommendations of that inquiry, whose commissioners included Justice A.C. Hamilton and Justice Murray Sinclair, addressed the severe problems confronting the Aboriginal community in the criminal justice system.

Even with one of the most surprising—and, as a New Democrat, I will say, devastating—defeats, Howard still had the presence of mind to call an inquiry to try to solve the problem. And that is important.

On the economic front, the Pawley government's record was at or near the top in provincial comparisons in respect to investment and employment growth and often enjoyed the lowest unemployment rate anywhere in Canada and sustained the Province's social programs during the recession of the early 1980s. As I've said

already, his government launched the giant Limestone hydro-generating project and negotiated major export agreements to sell hydroelectricity to the twin cities of Minneapolis and St. Paul at a price higher than Manitobans were paying.

On the social front, the Pawley government enacted changes to labour legislation, including pay equity, including final offer selection and first contract legislation, and Howard's government also introduced changes to The Human Rights Code, including the addition of the words sexual orientation, which became another major fight in this Legislature. And Howard, with his Attorney General, Roland Penner, were able to move the goalposts forward.

Now, as I've said, when, in March of 1988, after Larry Desjardins, the MP—or MLA for St. Boniface had resigned his seat, a backbench NDP voted against the government's budget and caused the government to fall, Howard had the grace and the political sense to resign as party leader and did not run in the subsequent election which ushered in the Progressive Conservative government led by Gary Filmon.

Despite his legal training and despite being well-read, Howard was prone to mixed metaphors and malapropisms, I believe we call them. And I'm advised that one of the most notable ones I can share occurred in the lead up to the 1986 election, which was expected by everybody to be very close. And Howard came in and announced in a very serious voice to his caucus and senior staff that the upcoming election was not going to be a cheese walk.

I'm also advised that another of Howard's specialties occurred following a meeting up in the Parkland when an MLA colleague assisted a woman who had collapsed. I'm not going to give the punchline here, Madam Speaker, but I am told that it created a stir in the crowd.

Howard's low-key style and his manner was well known within his own party, within the opposition members and also within the general public. It was an eastern writer who said that a big Friday night for Howard was going shopping and trying on gloves at Eaton's. And I don't actually know that Howard would have taken issue with that, because that's the kind of man he was.

My own personal experiences with Howard were limited. I remember being interviewed for an

articling position at Baker, Zivot where Howard practised after the 1988 election. I actually was interviewed first by Al Zivot, a very gracious man who happens to belong to a different party. We had a discussion, but then they brought in Howard. And the time being what it was, we soon got into a discussion about constitutional law. It was a time when, of course, the Meech Lake Accord was top of mind. Howard and I also had the chance much later, when he was the guest speaker at the party convention in Brandon, to discuss all kinds of issues in the life of an Attorney General and with respect to Manitoba Public Insurance.

Now, I know that we spend many long evenings in the committee rooms—maybe a long night tonight—where former premiers have their portraits hung on the wall, Madam Speaker. And it was Ed Schreyer who kind of broke the mould and changed the way that these portraits were done. If you look at the premiers before Ed Schreyer, they're all very formulaic. Generally, it's the premier wearing a suit, sitting in a chair, perhaps with the Legislature in the background. Well, Ed kind of changed that. If you look at his picture, he's standing above a river holding onto plans, almost certainly, to build a new hydro dam. Sterling Lyon continued to push the envelope and broke the mould by ensuring his very loyal dog was with him.

\* (15:50)

But Howard's portrait is maybe the most interesting. If you look at it, it features Howard sitting in front of what has to be a window at the Legislative Building. It has the same kind of radiators that many of us have in our offices, it's the same wood, but, if you look through the window, it's not Broadway and Osborne. It's actually the lower reaches of the Red River as it passes through Selkirk.

And two books sit on the desk next to Howard—and I know everyone's going to be looking, everyone who's in committee tonight—but one is a red book with the logo of Socialist International, which, for members opposite who may get upset, is a—it's a worldwide association of democratic socialist parties, social democratic parties and labour political parties around the world. The other volume is actually a fictional volume of Manitoba statutes, because it's defined as H175 to P215.

So what does that mean? Why did Howard have the person who painted his portrait include those two acts? Because The Human Rights Code and The Pay Equity Act, because the pathway towards equality

and social justice is always a pathway that Howard walked. It was always a pathway that he walked, and that's what he wanted to be his legacy to the people of Manitoba.

And he was soft-spoken, and he was a true gentleman, but he didn't back away from doing what was right, even when it came at a great cost to him, sometimes to his family, certainly to the party, but he didn't govern based on taking the easy way out. And he made mistakes—which he'll admit, which others in the media and politics were quite quick to point out—he made mistakes. But, at the end of the day, we see it: Howard was usually right.

Now, in speaking with people who worked most closely with Howard, one thing came through the most loud and clear—and I spoke to a lot of great New Democrats about this: he was a man who truly knew how to listen and valued what people had to say, which, as we throw accusations in this place or we put up our social media and we do our sound bites, isn't something, maybe, that we do as often as we should anymore, and that's to listen.

And whether as a constituent or the owner of a business or with another MLA, whatever the party, or a student, Howard gave his undivided attention to whoever he was speaking with, and I think that holds true value. And maybe that's something we can all work on. Maybe I can work on that. Maybe we all can.

So Premier Gary Doer used to say we stand on the shoulders of those who came before us, and how true that is with Howard Pawley. He was a lawyer, a politician, an educator, a humanitarian and, above all, a gentleman, and he will be missed.

Thank you.

**Mr. Reg Helwer (Brandon West):** I'm very pleased to rise today, reflect on the life of the honourable Howard Pawley, the 18th premier of Manitoba.

As the MLA for Selkirk, he was often a topic of conversation in our family gatherings, in our extended family in Selkirk, Tyndall, Garson, Beausejour and, you know, for many years, Madam Speaker, I thought that that's what families did on Christmas morning. You got up with your family, you opened your presents, you left them under the tree, you got in the car and you drove to grandma's house in Selkirk to meet with all your cousins and, eventually, talk of politics would come around.

So Mr. Pawley was, as I said, often a topic of conversation, and there were many sides in those conversations. It probably wouldn't surprise you, I don't think, that some of my relatives may even be-voted for him in Selkirk, and mostly because of the type of person that he was.

I first met Howard Pawley in person at—in the Brandon University Students' Union where I think at that time I was probably the president, and it was just after the election. I know prior to the election, I had—I was in the students' union offices late one night, and one of the cleaning staff came in who had escaped from what we then called the Iron Curtain countries and had found occupation cleaning at Brandon University.

And she was very, very fearful of what might happen with the election of socialists in Manitoba, and it took me probably half an hour to calm her down, to try to convince her that our socialists were not like their—her socialists, and that people wouldn't disappear at night and not be found. But it—she was very fearful, as was the business community.

But, you know, we did find after the election that although many things did change, it was not what one might expect. So the fear was perhaps—well, certainly was uncalled for, that she didn't need to be quite that afraid.

But he was in our offices in the student union very soon after the election. I can't remember the exact day, but I do remember him being quite relaxed and leaning against the counter and having discussions with the students in the office here and being very patient with us because students aren't—not always patient when they address politicians. And—but he was very comfortable with us, and I do appreciate that approach that he had to dealing with people.

As the MLA for Minto did mention, he did attend Manitoba Teachers' College, or what I grew up knowing as normal school, as my mother was also in that class and they finished that together. And my mother did go on to teach. Howard went on to, of course, other things. But it was part of their relationship, and I know that he often attended the reunions of that class with his wife Adele and had many conversations with my parents there. In fact, not that long ago, I think, in one of the reunions, he knew that I, of course, had been elected, and although he was appreciative that I had run for election and was elected as an MLA, he was convinced, or, trying to convince my father that I

should consider switching parties to see the proper light. And I think we'll have to disagree on that point.

But that is something that I always saw in him: he had an utter and complete belief in the cause, in his convictions, that he was correct. Often, as the MLA for Minto mentioned, the slings and arrows that he withstood in promoting the policies that he had a true and utter belief in were something that we don't often see in the Legislature. But I think it was a particularly contentious time there.

So, I guess, when I look back on my small relationship I had with him and my family's relationship, it's that he was such a sincere and gentle person and that he had that utter belief in his convictions, Madam Speaker.

Thank you.

**Mr. Dougald Lamont (Leader of the Second Opposition):** Madam Speaker, it's a profound honour to rise to commemorate the life of Howard Pawley, who played such an important role in Manitoba politics for decades.

He was a member of the CCF before it became the NDP, and his contributions to the province of Manitoba and Canada are many, varied and lasting.

He was born in Brampton and moved to Winnipeg at the age of 17, where he attended the Manitoba Teachers' College, United College and the Manitoba Law School. He was first elected in Selkirk, having run several times before, in 1969, in the wave that took the NDP to its first majority government in Manitoba under Ed Schreyer.

It was an era of seismic political change. The Schreyer government introduced a number of major progressive reforms and changes, and Mr. Pawley played an integral role in the creation of Manitoba's public auto-insurance system. At the time, the government of the day recognized and supported French language education in Manitoba in a way that had—simply had not been for decades, which altered the trajectory of the lives of tens of thousands of Manitobans for the better—mine included, because I met my wife, thanks to French immersion.

Mr. Pawley was like the premier when he defected—defeated the one-term government of Sterling Lyon and won in 1981, and again in 1986. During that time, he introduced a resolution entrenching French language rights in Manitoba, which faced stiff opposition at the time, as the member for Minto (Mr. Swan) mentioned. And

as the francophone community in Manitoba well knows, this was a turbulent time in national and provincial politics when it came to language rights. It occurred not long after the first referendum on the independence of Quebec and debates around the patriation of the Canadian constitution and the new Canadian Charter of Rights and Freedoms.

But, to give an indication of how dangerous things were, around that time in St. Boniface, the office of a French language advocacy group was firebombed. Eventually, the Supreme Court did recognize French language rights—that French language rights in Manitoba had to be expected.

Mr. Pawley also played an important role in calling for a strong federal government that could speak and act for all Canadians, express concern about the erosion of sovereignty and democracy that could occur under the Meech Lake Accord and the free trade agreement with the US.

\*(16:00)

His government also introduced landmark protections to the gender and sexually diverse community with changes to human rights legislation and stood tall in protecting the interests of minorities.

When I—I know it's a difficult—when people talk about how the Pawley government fell, I often think about it that history in—it was an example of how in this House history passes sometimes at the hands of a single person, that Jim Walding as a single person defeated the government, but it also ended up ushering in the possibility of Elijah Harper, as a single person, ending the Meech Lake Accord and altering the trajectory of Canadian history. It's one of the things that I really—I think about often when—and it's not—in a way I think that's an incredibly positive legacy of Mr. Pawley's, that he worked so hard to bring people in and was a champion for the underdog to the very end of his life.

In so many ways, again, as the member for Minto (Mr. Swan) said, Mr. Pawley's legacy is that, one, is it's progressive, it's far-reaching and it is as relevant today as it was in the 1970s and the 1980s on the environment, on making sure work pays, on French language rights, on minority rights. And former Premier Gary Filmon recalled Mr. Pawley as very dedicated to public service, to his principles and to the New Democratic Party. This is a substantial and extraordinary legacy of which Mr. Pawley's family can look back on with pride and which we should all appreciate.

On behalf of the people of St. Boniface and the Liberal caucus, we are grateful for the work of Mr. Pawley and what he accomplished in this Chamber for the people of Manitoba and for Canada.

Thank you.

**Mr. Wab Kinew (Leader of the Official Opposition):** I'm honoured and humbled to rise to pay tribute to former premier Howard Pawley.

Howard Pawley is the reason that I am a New Democrat. When Howard Pawley was premier, he created a program whereby people in Manitoba who lived in poverty could have their tuition for university paid for. Now, at the time, I was a little baby, living on a First Nation in Ontario, but unbeknownst to me, there was a young mother in Manitoba by the name of Debbie who was raising a few kids, one of them, Lisa, who today I'm very proud to call my wife, here in the inner city of Winnipeg. And Debbie experienced the reality that so many indigenous people in our country, both at that time and continuing to this day, experience, a life where the intergenerational impacts of failed government policies of the past leave them more likely to experience poverty and family violence and all manner of challenges in life.

And yet it was because Howard Pawley had the foresight and the inclination to advance opportunity in this province that he saw fit to bring about this program. And who was the recipient, who was one of the benefactors? Well, it was one young Debbie in the city of Winnipeg who had an opportunity to go to university through a program called WEC, which was part of this initiative. As an interesting sidebar, one of her instructors in this program when she joined was Greg Selinger, who would later go on to become premier of our province here and leader of the New Democratic Party.

But it was because Debbie was able to access university that she was able to lift her family out of poverty, and in so doing, she inspired her children to put a strong value on the importance of education. And they've all gone through school, and her oldest daughter, Lisa, became a medical doctor. And as a result of this transformation, their family is no longer trapped in poverty. Their family had the intelligence, their family had the willpower, their family had the determination to change their lives for the better. They had the willpower; they just needed some help finding-the-way power. And it was the government of Howard Pawley which made that a reality.



Now, I say that Howard Pawley is the reason that I'm a New Democrat because it is seeing those interventions that a New Democratic government in Manitoba has made in the past that, in a tangible and concrete and meaningful way, changed the lives of people that are very important for me, for the better. That is the reason that I signed an NDP card.

Again, I don't think people in Manitoba expect the government to do everything for them. But, when the government can do something, and does, to me, that is the purpose for what all of us are trying to accomplish in these hallowed halls and in this so sacred Chamber.

My colleague for Minto, our New Democratic whip, shared a story about how Murray Sinclair was appointed to the bench under Howard Pawley, as well, and it was a—just a few short days ago that I was exchanging some stories with Mr. Sinclair about this time in his career, and, to be quite honest, at first he didn't want to accept the appointment. He didn't think it was right for his career; he didn't think that he had done enough to earn that position, and yet Mr. Pawley had the foresight to name him to the bench.

And now look at how our country has changed as a result of that singular decision. In hindsight, perhaps a small decision, but a momentous one at the time that would launch Mr. Sinclair on his path to co-chairing the Aboriginal Justice Inquiry, to chairing the inquiry into pediatric cardiac deaths in Manitoba, and perhaps, most importantly, chairing the Truth and Reconciliation of Canada which, across all party lines, is respected as an important document that helps to chart forward our course here in Canada to this day.

So we owe a tremendous debt to Mr. Pawley for having the foresight to make a move like that, and, of course, we've heard about the other achievements. He stood up for French language rights at a time when it wasn't popular. He stood up as Attorney General to bring public auto insurance, who, you know, just a short time ago, long time—you know, social justice were in our province, told me it's probably the most courageous thing that the New Democrats ever did in Manitoba, and, you know, I'm sure many people will debate that point. But going out as Attorney General and greeting an angry crowd of more than 1,000 people on the steps of the Legislature—not ducking, not staying in your office, but going out to speak to that crowd and standing on the courage of your convictions to try and explain

your principles to them is a remarkable example of courage. And so I think we ought to hold that in high regard as well.

And, finally, you know, my own path to occupy a chair in this Chamber, it does touch on the Pawley government, as well, a little bit. You know, I often tell the story of my first time coming to the Legislative Building. I was a little kid, probably about nine years old or so, give or take, and it was shortly after J. J. Harper had been shot here in the streets of Winnipeg. And I showed up with my protest sign in hand, ready to change the world, and, you know, we came out here and we tried to make our voices heard.

And I tell that story in New Democrat circles, you know, party events—stuff like that. This is my first time coming to the Leg. My journey to having a chair in the front bench of the Manitoba Chamber began with being a little kid on the outside holding a picket sign.

So I tell that story and, you know, people chuckle or, like, they, you know, ask me about it. But, on one occasion, a man who many of us know, Vic Schroeder, came up to me after I told that story. He said, yes, that was an interesting story, Wab. Do you know that I was the Cabinet minister that they sent out to speak to you and that crowd at that protest?

And I had to laugh, and so me and, you know, Vic, we kind of exchanged a few more observations about that. But that was, again, a good example of Mr. Schroeder's, but, I think, also, a solid representation of the type of leadership that Howard Pawley set for his time as Premier of our province—that, again, you've got to face the music. You've got to be straight-up with people. People may not like everything that you do, but, at the very least, you owe them the respect of going out and talking to them.

And so whether it's on a personal level seeing the changes that were visited to my in-laws and to my family as a result, because now even my kids are benefiting from the change that was made as a result of that policy intervention made 30 years ago, whether it's the tenor that he brought to debate and to politics in this Chamber, or whether it's simply the legacy that he leaves as a family man here in Manitoba, I think that we are all richer for having had Howard Pawley as our Premier. And so we thank him.

But, most importantly, we send our condolences to his family for having shared him with us.

\* (16:10)

**Madam Speaker:** Is it the pleasure of the House to adopt the motion? [*Agreed*]

Would honourable members please rise and remain standing to indicate their support for the motion.

*A moment of silence was observed.*

#### **Roland Penner**

**Madam Speaker:** We will move on to the next condolence motion.

**Hon. Colleen Mayer (Minister of Crown Services):** I move, seconded by the member for Fort Rouge (Mr. Kinew), that this House convey to the family of the late Roland Penner, who served as member of Legislative Assembly of Manitoba, its sincere sympathy in their bereavement and in appreciation of his devotion to duty in a useful life of active community and public service, and that Madam Speaker be requested to forward a copy of this resolution to the family.

*Motion presented.*

**Mr. Wab Kinew (Leader of the Official Opposition):** I'm honoured to pay my respects to Roland Penner, who was born July 30th, 1924, and who passed away May 31st, 2018, and to offer my sincere and heartfelt condolences to his family.

I'm honoured to pay my respects to Roland Penner as the leader today of Manitoba's New Democratic Party. I'm also very honoured to pay my respects as his successor as the MLA for Fort Rouge. But, most of all, I'm honoured to pay my respects as a Manitoban, a resident of this province that is so much more free and has so much more concern for the well-being of the people who live here than it otherwise might have been were it not for Roland Penner.

As a member of the Legislature representing the great people of Fort Rouge, Roland served as the Attorney General. During the French language crisis, he saw the passage of the Manitoba Human Rights Code, which included protections for sexual orientation, and he passed FIPPA and PHIA laws.

During his time in the Pawley government, he also served as the minister of Education, was the head of the Treasury Board, was the minister

responsible for MLCC and was the government House leader.

Outside of this Legislature, Mr. Penner also led a remarkable life. He was a veteran of the Canadian Forces who served in World War II; he was the chair of Legal Aid Manitoba and served as the dean of the law school at the University of Manitoba.

Through it all, Roland demonstrated remarkable courage and conviction, moral clarity and strength of character. I say this because he achieved major breakthroughs for social justice and equality even as he faced protests from anti-abortion protesters, had his office occupied by an LGBT activist who was conducting a hunger strike and even faced opposition in his own caucus on some of the issues that he held closest to his heart.

Through it all, he never wavered from his pursuit of his, quote, glowing dream, unquote, of a more just and fair Manitoba. He might bend, finding workarounds, behind-the-scenes machinations or lobbying techniques to move his vision forward, but he never broke. And we are all richer for that, Madam Speaker.

Roland Penner was born in Winnipeg to his parents, Jacob Penner and Rose Shapak, along with his twin sister, Ruthie. They grew up in and around the city's North End with their parents and siblings. Now, both Roland's mom and dad were active members of the Communist Party of Canada, and Roland was referred to as a, quote, red-diaper baby, unquote.

Now, in spite of—or maybe because of—that party affiliation, but mainly due to the great constituency work that he did and a remarkable gift for oratory, Jacob Penner—Roland's dad—was a city councillor for some 25 years. Council colleagues of all political stripes would praise him for his integrity.

After World War II broke out, Roland's dad, Jacob Penner, was locked up in an internment camp for more than two years, from June of 1940 to July of 1942. Roland wrote on the day of his father's arrest, the police officers who showed up at his house arrived sheepishly, knowing that they were there to pick up a popular and hard-working, well-respected sitting member of the city council. Jacob Penner would be held under the War Measures Act without a charge for that entire two-year period that he was interned. Perhaps that's why, a generation later, when his son became the Attorney General tasked with implementing the Canadian Charter of

Rights and Freedoms, Roland Penner committed to never using the notwithstanding clause here in Manitoba. Such was his conviction towards human rights.

Let us forget—let us not forget that our human rights include the right to due process and the freedoms from unnecessary detention, among many others—human rights that Mr. Jacob Penner was deprived of during the Second World War.

Now, despite what was happening with his dad during the time, Roland Penner enlisted in the Canadian Forces on the day of his 18th birthday, joining the Canadian artillery. He did his basic training here in Winnipeg and then in 'Petawata'—in Petawawa. Coincidentally, Petawawa is one of the places that his father was interned during the Second World War. Roland landed on Juno Beach about a month after D-Day and was part of the effort to chase the Nazis from the coast back across the Seine River.

After the war, Roland completed his bachelor's degree and his law degree at the University of Manitoba. Now, during his days as a student, he was a member of the debate team at U of M, along with one Frank Lamont, who, I understand, is the late father of our colleague, the member for St. Boniface (Mr. Lamont).

Now, it was during this period that Roland Penner discovered that he couldn't cross the American border as a result of his own affiliation with the Communist Party. This was a situation that wouldn't be rectified until he became the Attorney General of Manitoba. He also was under surveillance for many periods during his youth. He began to grow disillusioned with the Communist Party, beginning with that party's opposition to World War II, a war, obviously, that Roland fought in courageously. But, eventually, he left the Communist Party and ceased that affiliation following Khrushchev's 1956 revelations about Stalin's reign of terror and the crushing of the Hungarian uprising by Soviet forces.

Now, it would take a while for him to find his way to the NDP, but he enjoyed a remarkable legal career in the interim, standing up for many vulnerable Manitobans, taking on many interesting cases that he recounts in his memoir, but also going on to serve as chair of Legal Aid Manitoba. It was during his time as chair of Legal Aid that he would meet then-Attorney General Howard Pawley, who would later ask him to serve in his Cabinet. It was during that period that his legal partner, the late

Vic Savino—who's actually a friend of our family, as well—but it was the late Vic Savino who asked Roland Penner to sign an NDP membership card. It's kind of a funny story. Apparently, Vic Savino was seeking the nomination for the Fort Rouge constituency for the NDP, so he got Roland to sign up an NDP membership card. Roland came to the nomination meeting to support Vic Savino, but he was so inspired by the speech that Muriel Smith gave at the nomination meeting that he actually ended up voting for Muriel.

Now, a few years later, a group of people, including Vic—who didn't hold a grudge over this issue—including Muriel, including Ginny Devine, the wife of former Premier Gary Doer—and others approached Roland about running for the NDP in Fort Rouge. So some four years later, he decided to throw his hat in the ring.

\* (16:20)

Roland Penner was elected the MLA for Fort Rouge on December 2nd, 1981, some 29 days before I was born. Now, as a rookie MLA, he was immediately appointed by Howard Pawley as the Attorney General, the House leader and the head of the Treasury Board—quite a baptism by fire.

Now, the Chief Justice of Manitoba—shortly after his election, the Chief Justice then, at the time, the Chief Justice Sam Friedman would soon give him some important advice that as the Attorney General of Manitoba, he should act as, quote, the first law officer of the Crown, end quote.

Roland Penner would take this advice to heart, and it informed his approach to this issue of abortion in Manitoba. In 1983, Dr. Morgentaler announced plans to open an abortion clinic on Corydon Avenue here in the city of Winnipeg and, surrounded by media, he walked into Minister Penner's office and asked if he were to be charged with a crime for committing abortion, whether Minister Penner would stay the proceedings.

Of course, abortion was, at that time, against the law in Canada. Minister Penner said, no, he would not stay the proceedings. Again, he was keeping the advice that he had received from the Chief Justice to act as, quote, the first law officer of the Crown, end quote, in mind.

Now, Minister Penner's fear was that unless he discharged the duties of his office in an unbiased and non-political manner that perhaps he'd set a bad precedent, and soon the country could become a

checkerboard of laws based on the individual whims or political views of the attorney generals—Attorneys General in each of the other provinces.

Now, make no mistake, Madam Speaker, Mr. Penner was pro-choice. He supported a woman's right to choose. Now, soon Dr. Morgentaler was charged for providing abortions in our city and, sure enough, Penner did not stay those charges.

What he may or may not have done is suggested that those proceedings might be delayed, pending a constitutional challenge to Canada's abortion law at the time. Sure enough, the constitutional challenge was successful. The abortion—anti-abortion law was struck down and abortion became legal all across our country.

Now, the reason why I choose to put this episode on the record is because, to me, it represents a meaningful balancing act that Mr. Penner struck between fulfilling the duties of his public office while also staying true to his deep personal convictions. Not an easy test, but it's one that, I think, that he passed in that instance.

Now, pendant la période de 1981 jusqu'à 1985, Roland Penner a été deeply—était vraiment engagé avec la crise de langue française.

**Translation**

*During the period from 1981 to 1985, Roland Penner was deeply involved in the French-language crisis.*

**English**

Now, French has been recognized since our province's founding.

Depuis le temps de la création de notre province, la langue française était reconnue dans le projet de Loi du Manitoba—

**Translation**

*Since the creation of our province, the French language has been recognized under The Manitoba Act—*

**English**

The Manitoba Act—but it took a young law student by the name of Bilodeau to traffic—to challenge a traffic ticket here in our province for French to truly become an official language.

Now, while this saga played out, there was immense public outcry. There were attacks, and, in some cases, there was very brutal and visceral racism

directed at French people here in Manitoba. It was also a political crisis as well. In 1984, the Progressive Conservatives rang the bells in this building for many months, trying to inflame the issue, and it worked, to a certain extent at least, Madam Speaker.

Now, the unpopularity of bringing bilingualism to Manitoba contributed to the fall—the eventual fall of the Pawley government, but, before that, in 1985, a Supreme Court of Canada decision found that the constitution was supreme everywhere in Canada and that the consequence was that all Manitoba statutes were invalid, and it was up to Roland Penner to sift through that aftermath.

Years later, Mr. Penner would observe that even though Gary Doer played a prominent role in the French language crisis, he became one of the most popular premiers in Manitoba history. Now, what did Roland Penner—what lesson did Roland Penner take from observing that?

Well, later write in his memoir that, in the long run, taking a principled position on human rights succeeds. What a remarkable example for us to follow.

*Mr. Doyle Pivniuk, Deputy Speaker, in the Chair*

Roland Penner says—said that his proudest moment in politics came on July 16th, 1987, when bill 47, the Manitoba Human Rights Code, passed third reading in this Chamber. Now, aside from protecting human rights generally, it specifically protected the rights of the LGBTTQ\* community in our province. This issue of protection around the basis of sexual orientation received all the attention, and it was very controversial on all sides of the House.

At Roland's celebration of life earlier this year, the former mayor of Winnipeg, Glen Murray, actually shared a story about this period. Now, Mr. Murray, who was at that time an LGBT activist on the rise here in Winnipeg, came to the Legislature to lobby for the Manitoba Human Rights Code. Now, on the way in, Mr. Penner—and I'm paraphrasing here, so I may get the exact verbatim wrong—but on the way in, Mr. Penner told Glen Murray, good, we need help convincing the caucus. Mr. Murray assumes, okay, help convincing the Progressive Conservative caucus. And Mr. Penner replied, no, we need to convince my caucus about these changes to the Manitoba Human Rights Code.

Now, it took three years to get that Human Rights Code passed, and its passage, even at the time that it was being put to a vote, was not guaranteed, specifically that provision. And until the very last minute, Roland Penner contemplated resigning if that bill was defeated, not just resigning as Attorney General, but resigning from the government as well. Such was the strength of his conviction.

So when we reflect on this remarkable period in our province's history, I think there are two observations we can make—many observations, but two in particular that I want to make today, and I'll make them in short order.

Howard Pawley was the premier who had the courage to stake his government on these important steps towards social justice. And Roland Penner was the moral conscious that always and without fail pushed Howard Pawley towards doing the right thing. Penner was certainly helped along the way by Eugene Szach, Aaron Berg, Nancy Allen, Ginny Devine and many other special assistants and constituency assistants who worked with him at the Legislature during this period.

After leaving politics, Roland became the dean of the law school at the University of Manitoba, received the Order of Canada and became an author.

Through it all Roland Penner was a devoted family man, with his wife Janet and his first wife Addie, he welcomed daughters Kathy, Anna and Pen, as well as sons Dan and Paul to this world. He also has many grandchildren.

Now, many people often say that the truest test of any person who chooses to become a parent is how well they fulfill that most sacred task of being a mom or being a dad. Having met his kids and having met a few of his grandkids, I could tell you that by that measure Roland Penner's life was a remarkable success. His kids are progressive activists, arts aficionados and great people in their own rights and certainly are doing him proud and carrying on his legacy.

His family, led by his wife Janet and daughter Kathy, are actually here with us today in the gallery. And so let us all keep them in our hearts and minds as they grieve such a great person that they were privileged to know so well and lend to us for a short period of time.

Now, to them, I want to leave my condolences, but to the others here in the Chamber and, you know, perhaps around the province, I ask, what are we

to make of Roland Penner's legacy? Well, it is impressive, to say the least: LGBT rights, French language rights, FIPPA, PHIA, a woman's right to choose. Think of how our province has changed as a result of Roland Penner's willingness to stand up, often in this Chamber, even if it was uncomfortable, even if it was not popular, even if it meant putting your political career on the line, standing up and ensuring that we do the right thing.

\*(16:30)

Now, we have all changed. You think back about those changes that he brought into this province; some of those things aren't even controversial anymore, Mr. Acting Speaker, and that's a testament to how much our province has changed. Certainly, the Progressive Conservatives don't oppose French language rights anymore. Myself, the change that I have undergone as an individual, from speaking with disrespectful terminology towards the LGBT community to now using my power and influence to help try and support the community and be a good ally, is also a testament to change. I believe the Premier (Mr. Pallister) has undergone a transformation, perhaps, as well, when it comes to LGBT rights.

But all of those changes are part of the legacy that Roland Penner brought to this province. Now, change for the better is certainly an important thing, and he did help us to change for the better.

Our capacity for change is best realized when we have courageous people, not just to lead but also to clear space for us, people like Roland Penner. And he led, but importantly, he also cleared the space for us to follow, and by that measure, each and every one of us in the Province of Manitoba today is following in his footsteps.

I'd like to close my statement of condolence with a quote from Mr. Penner. Quote: legislation, statute or constitutional, can be a beacon that sometimes shows us the darkness from which we have come and the light towards which we aspire. End quote.

Roland Penner, Order of Canada, Attorney General, dean of law, you will be missed, but our province is so much richer, better off, and today more free for having known you.

**Mr. Deputy Speaker:** Is there any further speakers?

**Mr. Ian Wishart (Portage la Prairie):** It is my pleasure to put a few words on the record today regarding Roland Penner and the time that he served

here in the House as MLA, and on his life in general, because he certainly made a very major mark on Manitoba in a number of ways, not only as MLA but afterwards as he served as dean at University of Manitoba in the law school.

I'd like to begin by extending my condolences to the family of Roland Penner. I know that many Manitobans would certainly share that—like to share that opportunity.

Mr. Penner served in this House and the residents of Fort Rouge for seven years, from '81 to '88, as has been said, and served under former premier Pawley. Roland was given the major and monumental task of being Attorney General, government House leader and chairman of the Treasury Board, and as has been said, any one of those jobs is a major undertaking by itself. Having taken them on all at the same time was a major workload, and certainly served—he served very well in that regard.

He was the minister responsible for the administration of The Liquor Control Act, the minister of Consumer and Corporate Affairs, as well, at different times, and minister responsible for Constitutional Affairs and minister of Education, at different times, so has, in many ways, marked Manitoba's history and Manitoba's progress in terms of legislation.

But he was a very important member of the Pawley cabinet and highly respected by his community, as well as at the Legislature. In his time as Attorney General, he brought about The Manitoba Human Rights Code, and that alone has made a significant change here in Manitoba to—for all of us over a number of years. And as has been said, he brought in a number of features as part of The Human Rights Code that have changed a lot of things for a lot of people in Manitoba.

And as well, he brought—was responsible for bringing in freedom of information legislation that we use every day and is important to all Manitobans and has become part of the standard that we expect of this place and politics in general.

Mr. Penner also went on to teach law for many years at the University of Manitoba. And I know I had spoken to a number of lawyers who were exposed to his teachings at that time, and had only great things to say about his influence on their life and the standard that he brought to his teaching education program and that was passed on to a

number of students. And, in that regard, he too had a significant impact on the legal industry here in Manitoba and law.

He also served as founding chair and president of Legal Aid, something that is of great value here in Manitoba and continues to be an important part of what makes Manitoba unique.

His tireless work outside of the Chamber as a lawyer and a professor earned him respect and admiration for all who knew him, leaves behind a great legacy and as well a wonderful family. And I know he will be dearly missed.

Thank you.

**Hon. Jon Gerrard (River Heights):** I want to extend condolences to the family and friends of Roland Penner on behalf of myself and the Manitoba Liberal Party caucus.

I had the opportunity to meet and to talk with Roland Penner on quite a number of occasions. I was always impressed by his openness, his wisdom, his insight into the condition of people in Manitoba, into the law and into the political situation in our province, and also his sense of humour.

Roland Penner served in the army in the Second World War. He graduated from the University of Manitoba law school and was called to the bar in 1961, when he was 37. He had a knowledge of the law, especially constitutional law, criminal law, labour law and the law related to the Canadian Charter of Rights and Freedoms, which was incredible—probably second to almost no one else.

He taught for many years at the University of Manitoba in the law school, and I have a remark from one of the students here, which I'll quote. A student who was a regular at skipping classes, but he says this of Roland Penner: He was the first professor whose intellect almost startled me, whose knowledge and thoughtfulness so totally engaged me and whose wit and sense of humour so entertained me. It seemed all—quite incongruous that somebody could be that smart and also that funny.

You can be sure, he didn't skip any of Roland Penner's classes.

He was a brilliant raconteur, debater, teacher. And, of course, he served a number of important roles in the government of Howard Pawley and made many contributions.

I want to talk primarily about his contributions in the area of human rights and the fact that he not only brought forward The Human Rights Code, but he included in the code a prohibition on discrimination on the basis of sexual orientation. As a member of the Legislature who's a strong believer in the importance of human rights and is currently trying to include a prohibition of discrimination on the basis of physical size and weight, I am an admirer of the contributions of Roland Penner in this area. They have been outstanding. He was concerned about rights for all. He was particularly and 'notewortherly' concerned about rights for those with varied sexual orientation. And he was concerned about rights for those in Manitoba's francophone community.

And so, on behalf of our Liberal caucus, I say: Thank you, Roland Penner. Merci, Roland Penner. Miigwech. You have contributed a lot to our province.

**Mr. Deputy Speaker:** Is there any further speakers?

Is it the pleasure of the House to adopt the motion? *[Agreed]*

I would now like to have all honourable members please rise and remain standing, and indicate their support for this motion.

*A moment of silence was observed.*

**Mr. Deputy Speaker:** Please be seated.

\* (16:40)

**Hon. Kelvin Goertzen (Government House Leader):** Mr. Deputy Speaker, could you seek leave of the House to call it 5 o'clock?

**Mr. Deputy Speaker:** Seek leave to call it 5 o'clock? *[Agreed]*

The hour being 5 o'clock, the House is adjourned and stands adjourned until 10 a.m. tomorrow morning.

# LEGISLATIVE ASSEMBLY OF MANITOBA

Wednesday, October 24, 2018

## CONTENTS

| <b>ROUTINE PROCEEDINGS</b>                  |      |  |      |
|---|------|--|------|
| <b>Tabling of Reports</b>                   |      | Lead Contamination Levels                  |      |
| Driedger                                    | 3733 | Lamont                                     | 3741 |
|   |      | Pallister                                  | 3741 |
| <b>Members' Statements</b>                  |      | Northern Patient Transportation Program    |      |
| Canadian Forces Operation UNIFIER           |      | Lathlin                                    | 3742 |
| Curry                                       | 3733 | Friesen                                    | 3742 |
| Bear Clan Patrol                            |      | Budget 2019                                |      |
| B. Smith                                    | 3734 | Helwer                                     | 3743 |
|   |      | Fielding                                   | 3743 |
| Islamic History Month Canada                |      | Provincial Nominee Program                 |      |
| Fontaine                                    | 3734 | Lamoureux                                  | 3743 |
|   |      | Goertzen                                   | 3743 |
| Provincial Economy and Conflict of Interest |      | Northern Air Services                      |      |
| Fletcher                                    | 3734 | Lindsey                                    | 3744 |
| 575 Terrier Royal Canadian Air Cadets       |      | Pallister                                  | 3745 |
| Wishart                                     | 3735 |  |      |
| <b>Oral Questions</b>                       |      | <b>Petitions</b>                           |      |
| City of Winnipeg                            |      | Seven Oaks General Hospital Emergency Room |      |
| Kinew                                       | 3735 | B. Smith                                   | 3745 |
| Pallister                                   | 3736 | Vimy Arena                                 |      |
| Public Transit Services                     |      | Fletcher                                   | 3746 |
| Kinew                                       | 3736 | Medical Laboratory Services                |      |
| Pallister                                   | 3736 | Gerrard                                    | 3746 |
| Methamphetamine Crisis                      |      | Tina Fontaine–Public Inquiry               |      |
| Kinew                                       | 3736 | Allum                                      | 3747 |
| Pallister                                   | 3737 | Concordia Hospital Emergency Room          |      |
| Federal Carbon Pricing                      |      | Wiebe                                      | 3748 |
| Kinew                                       | 3737 |  |      |
| Pallister                                   | 3737 |  |      |
| Emissions Reduction                         |      |  |      |
| Kinew                                       | 3738 |  |      |
| Pallister                                   | 3738 |  |      |
| Climate and Green Plan Act                  |      |  |      |
| Kinew                                       | 3738 |  |      |
| Pallister                                   | 3738 |  |      |
| Education Review Commission                 |      |  |      |
| Wiebe                                       | 3739 |  |      |
| Goertzen                                    | 3739 |  |      |
| Methamphetamine Crisis                      |      |  |      |
| B. Smith                                    | 3740 |  |      |
| Friesen                                     | 3740 |  |      |



Howard R. Pawley

Mayer

Swan

Helwer

Lamont

Kinew

3755

3755

3760

3761

3762

Roland Penner

Mayer

Kinew

Wishart

Gerrard

3764

3764

3767

3768

The Legislative Assembly of Manitoba Debates and Proceedings  
are also available on the Internet at the following address:

**<http://www.gov.mb.ca/legislature/hansard/hansard.html>**