



LEGISLATIVE ASSEMBLY OF MANITOBA

VOTES AND PROCEEDINGS No. 8

FIFTH SESSION, FORTY-SECOND LEGISLATURE

PRAYER AND LAND ACKNOWLEDGEMENT

1:30 O'CLOCK P.M.

The Clerk formally advised the Assembly that the Speaker was unavoidably absent and called upon the Deputy Speaker to take the Chair pursuant to the Statutes. The Deputy Speaker took the Chair at 1:30 p.m.

The following Bill was read a First Time and had its purposes outlined:

(No. 8) – The Off-Road Trails Safety and Maintenance Act/Loi sur la sécurité et l'entretien des sentiers pour véhicules à caractère non routier

(Hon. Mr. WHARTON)

Hon. Mr. SMITH (Lagimodière), the Minister of Sport, Culture and Heritage, made a statement regarding Holodomor.

Mr. WASYLIW and, by leave, Ms. LAMOUREUX commented on the statement.

Hon. Mr. CULLEN, the Minister of Economic Development, Investment and Trade, made a statement regarding Small Business Saturday.

Mr. MOSES and, by leave, Mr. LAMONT commented on the statement.

Pursuant to Rule 28(1), Mr. SCHULER, Ms. NAYLOR, Mr. LAGASSÉ, MLA LINDSEY and Hon. Mr. GERRARD made Members' Statements.

Following Oral Questions, Hon. Mr. GOERTZEN rose on a Point of Order regarding an unparliamentary gesture given by the Honourable Member for St. Boniface.

And Mr. LAMONT having voluntarily apologized,

And Mr. KINEW having spoken,

WHEREUPON the Deputy Speaker informed the House that there was a Point of Order and considered the matter resolved.

The following petition was presented and read to the Legislative Assembly of Manitoba:

Hon. Mr. GERRARD – To urge the Provincial Government to partner with organizations that provide individual and group supports and online resources for children and adults with executive function disorders, and IQs above 75, including online videos featuring individuals with executive function disorders raising awareness and explaining a strength-based way to fully develop their executive function capabilities, a manual listing all resources for those with executive function defects, learning modules and instructional videos teaching daily tasks that involve executive function, and a free online webinar series to enable individuals with executive function deficiencies to access government supports; to improve funding for Community Living Disability Services (CLDS) and other organizations which can provide support for those with executive function disorders in order to reduce wait times for those who need to access them; to recognize that individuals with executive function disorders with a normal to high IQ have great potential to be gainfully employed, provided they have some supports, and to set up initiatives to help these individuals get and keep jobs, including a public awareness campaign; to recognize that individuals who are helping those with executive function disorders are essential partners and enable them to accompany the person into a hospital or other situations as necessary, regardless of age; and to mandate that all teachers take courses on learning disabilities including executive function disorders, during their post-secondary education in order to better understand and educate, and end the discrimination they often experience in the classroom.

Hon. Mr. GOERTZEN sought and received leave to waive Rules 63 and 64, and to replace the process for dealing with Condolence motions in those Rules with the following process:

1. Condolence motions for deceased former Members of the Legislative Assembly of Manitoba shall be called as part of Routine Proceedings, prior to Petitions or Matters of Urgent Public Importance, if the Speaker has received written notice from a House Leader of a Recognized Party 90 minutes prior to the start of the sitting day.
2. Written notice to the Speaker should include the name(s) of the deceased Member(s) to be commemorated that day, and should be copied to the other House Leader, the Member for River Heights, the Clerk and the Deputy Clerk.
3. The category of Condolences will not appear on the daily Order Paper.
4. For each Motion:
 - a. Ten minutes of speaking time will be allocated to Members from the deceased Member's political party.
 - b. Five minutes of speaking time will be allocated to Members from another political party.
 - c. Five minutes of speaking time will be allocated to Independent Members.
 - d. Within those speaking time allocations the parties or Independent Members may assign as many Members as they wish to speak.
5. At the conclusion of the speeches, the Speaker shall put the question and ask Members to signify their approval of the motion by rising in their places to observe a moment of silence.

6. Following the passage of any Condolence motion the Speaker's Office shall send to the deceased Member's family the Hansard transcript from that sitting day, along with a personal letter of Condolence from the Speaker, as well as letters of Condolence from any other Members who were unable to speak during the Tribute. These letters must be received by the Speaker's Office within five days of the passage of the motion in the House.

This agreement expires on December 1, 2022.

The House resumed the debate on the Proposed Motion of Mr. GUENTER:

THAT the following address be presented to Her Honour the Lieutenant Governor:

We, the Members of the Legislative Assembly of Manitoba thank your Honour for the gracious speech addressed to us at this Fifth Session of the Forty-Second Legislature of Manitoba.

And the proposed amendment moved by Mr. KINEW as follows:

THAT the motion be amended by adding at the end the following words:

But this House regrets that the Provincial Government has:

- a) demonstrated to Manitobans that the Premier is continuing former Premier Brian Pallister's agenda of health care cuts and privatization while giving cheques to billionaires; and
- b) refused to reverse its cuts to public health care and is instead pushing through further privatization of Manitoba's public health care system, bringing the province closer to a costlier and inequitable American-style two-tier health care system; and
- c) failed to address the current health care crisis in Manitoba that is putting intense strain on front line health care workers and patients waiting in pain in emergency rooms, especially in pediatric facilities such as the Health Science Centre's Children's Hospital; and
- d) continued to cut northern healthcare and mental health services in the north; and
- e) failed to fill widespread staff vacancies in homecare so that seniors and vulnerable Manitobans have access to quality and timely care; and
- f) refused to call an independent public inquiry into Manitoba's pandemic response to learn from its mistakes and bring forward changes to improve the lives of Manitoba families and strengthen the health care system; and
- g) continued to cut and underfund K-12 education in Manitoba while class sizes keep on increasing, while offering no real plans to support adult education; and

- h) refused to address the addictions crisis by failing to provide investments into harm reduction initiatives including safe consumption sites; and
- i) continued to make misleading statements on safe consumption sites by citing non-existent safe consumption sites in California; and
- j) refused to address the housing crisis by failing to build affordable social and supportive housing; and
- k) failed to act to improve access to mental health services across the province, particularly for youth and children and those living in remote and rural areas, as well as supports for children in Child and Family Services care; and
- l) failed to take actions to address the epidemic of Missing and Murdered Women, Girls and Two-Spirited people and failed to offer any concrete supports to help prevent domestic violence and to help those fleeing domestic violence; and
- m) failed to outline how the Provincial Government will reduce the number of children in Child and Family Services care and support those who have left the system; and
- n) continued to make life more expensive for average Manitobans by raising taxes on renters, cutting services, hiking hydro rates, attacking workers and increasing the price of essentials at the grocery store while offering no supports for producers; and
- o) refused to support workers while freezing their wages and undermining workers in the public service by leaving positions vacant in important sectors such as highway safety and health care; and
- p) continued to attack collective bargaining in the province while failing to bring in paid sick days or health and safety supports for working Manitobans to keep them safe and healthy at work; and
- q) refused to take concrete initiatives to advance reconciliation with Indigenous Peoples of Manitoba yet again by failing to complete legally required duties or make progress to repair the damage caused by former Premier Pallister's hurtful comments; and
- r) refused to increase funding for municipalities like Brandon, Dauphin, Selkirk, Gimli, Thompson and Flin Flon, leaving their budgets frozen for the 7th straight year; and
- s) failed to take meaningful action to combat climate change, while pushing ahead with a plan to privatize provincial parks; and

- t) failed to mention the fact the province has failed to even start the Lake Manitoba/Lake St. Martin Channels project while underspending by millions of dollars in infrastructure projects such as highway maintenance and repair and failing to staff road clearing services adequately especially in northern Manitoba; and
- u) continued its attack on post-secondary students and institutions by forging ahead with the plan to cut funding for universities and colleges while increasing tuition and failing to support English language services for newcomers and refugees; and
- v) failed to offer any vision for supporting the people of northern Manitoba as the Provincial Government continues to cut essential business supports for the people of the north; and
- w) offered no supports for producers suffering from high input costs and other challenges during this cost of living crisis; and
- x) failed to support francophone services in Manitoba; and
- y) failed to support an expansion of broadband services in rural and northern Manitoba; and
- z) failed to mention how the Provincial Government will work towards creating an equitable Manitoba for everyone, particularly people of colour, women, Indigenous peoples and members of equity seeking groups; and
- aa) failed to fill vacancies in important positions in the justice department such as Crown attorneys in locations across the province; and
- bb) failed to implement a comprehensive plan to support people with disabilities during this cost of living crisis.

As a consequence of these and many other failings, the Provincial Government has thereby lost the trust and confidence of the people of Manitoba and this House.

And the proposed sub-amendment moved by Mr. LAMONT as follows:

THAT the motion be amended by adding after clause (bb) the following clauses:

- cc) failed utterly to recognize that the Covid pandemic is not yet over and that for many people, businesses and organizations, life and work now is harder than at any point during the pandemic; and
- dd) failed to accept responsibility for its own role in creating a health care crisis by cutting and freezing actual health spending, and forcing the closure of clinics; and
- ee) failed to commit to equity in federal health care funding for Canadian Health Transfers, which would see an immediate improvement in Manitoba's health funding if it were calculated based on need, instead of on the current, grossly unfair per capita formula; and

- ff) failed to commit to being responsible and accountable for federal health care funds for mental health, seniors, and instead demanded money from others without accountability; and
- gg) failed to apologize to nurses for forcing them to endure impossible working conditions which include not ending mandatory overtime or providing them and other health care workers coverage for burnout, as requested by the Manitoba Nurses' Union, which is driving nurses from the system; and
- hh) failed to maintain or strengthen hospital capacity which has resulted in a critical shortage of bed space and excessive wait times for patients that resulted in a bottleneck of patients waiting for medical care and surgeries; and
- ii) failed to introduce a plan to increase the capacity of family and specialist physicians in Manitoba, where the province currently boasts the lowest and third lowest number in the country respectively; and
- jj) failed to develop a comprehensive retention plan to ensure equitable healthcare delivery in rural and northern communities; and
- kk) failed to reinstate full and proper healthcare coverage for international students while recognizing the disproportionate impact of inflation on living costs for students; and
- ll) failed to present a comprehensive strategy to tackle diabetes in Manitoba, in particular, by not providing complete coverage for insulin pumps and CGMs for people of all ages or implementing strategies as proposed by Diabetes Canada's Diabetes 360's Framework; and
- mm) failed to launch awareness campaigns and education about diabetes prevention and complication issues, particularly among Indigenous communities and vulnerable populations; and
- nn) failed to ensure equitable access to dialysis services in rural Manitoba; and
- oo) failed to recognize hearing loss as a medical treatment under Manitoba Health and provide income-based coverage for hearing aids to all who need them, especially seniors age 65 and older; and
- pp) failed to provide dental care for seniors who cannot pay for coverage without sacrificing basic needs; and
- qq) failed to take action to create an independent, non-partisan Senior's Advocate to assist in creating policies and recommendations on issues that have been ignored for decades under previous governments; and
- rr) failed to articulate a plan to increase Manitoba's economic self-reliance, choosing instead to focus on Manitoba as a "Branch Plant Economy" where Manitobans will toil for owners and investors, with the result that all profits will be located outside the province; and

- ss) failed to create a venture capital fund that is politically independent and accessible to all Manitobans; and
- tt) failed utterly to pursue justice measures or take action against gangs that will be effective in reducing crime through prevention, ignoring proven and effective measures of anti-gang interventions, youth justice committees, and community intervention such as providing individuals with positive alternatives in recreation and jobs, including safe spaces for youth; and
- uu) failed to call inquiries into the construction of Winnipeg's Police Headquarters, despite multiple requests to do so and evidence of bribes and other illegal activities taking place; and
- vv) failed to call a public inquiry into Peter Nygard, who is currently awaiting trial on multiple accounts of sexual assault, attacks on women and underage girls, including Indigenous women, in Manitoba and beyond; and
- ww) failed to ensure that municipalities have adequate funding to fund community services and safe spaces to keep people out of trouble; and
- xx) failed to protect against provincial vulnerability due to a dependence on federal transfers, instead of strengthening Manitoba's own source revenues to fund core programs and services; and
- yy) failed to protect ratepayers by introducing measures to weaken and politically interfere with the Public Utilities Board which will result in substantial, irresponsibly imposed hydro rate increases; and
- zz) failed to apply education property tax rebates through a model of equity, whereas the current model has resulted in enormous cheques for wealthy property owners, while squeezing the incomes of the lowest-income Manitobans; and
- aaa) failed to recognize the toll that the cost of living has taken on the most vulnerable populations and failing to address the basic needs of these Manitobans, particularly seniors, families with children, and people living with disabilities; and
- bbb) failed to protect women and children fleeing domestic violence by cutting and freezing resources meant to support victims, including women's shelters, Second Stage Housing, Shelter Crisis Lines, and specialized programs; and
- ccc) failed to ensure that children who age out of care from CFS, and those with learning disabilities, ADHD, and autism are provided proper supports when and after they turn 18; and
- ddd) failed to commit to returning \$338 million, that was illegally seized by successive PC and NDP Provincial Governments from children belonging to First Nations in CFS from 2006-2019, and recognizing that doing so is an important step in the process of reconciliation by the Provincial Government; and

- eee) failed to ensure that full and universal coverage is available for individuals accessing Opioid Agonist Treatment (OAT), and failed to ensure that people without appropriate healthcare coverage are able to access timely treatment for opioid addictions; and
- fff) failed to adequately support the transition to electric vehicles in Manitoba by insufficiently investing to ensure widespread availability of electric charging stations in Manitoba and insufficiently supporting the purchase of electric vehicles; and
- ggg) failed to mention the importance of preserving the quality of groundwater in south-eastern Manitoba; and
- hhh) failed to put forward a strategy to reduce the use of pesticides and herbicides in Manitoba; and
- iii) failed to mention any effort to support the immigration of people from Afghanistan to Manitoba to help those whose lives are threatened in their country of origin and to help address skilled shortages in Manitoba; and
- jjj) failed to put forward a plan in the Throne Speech to advance reconciliation.

And the debate continuing on the sub-amendment,

And Hon. Mr. HELWER, Mrs. SMITH (Point Douglas), Mr. SANDHU, Ms. LATHLIN, Messrs. WIEBE and REDHEAD, Hon. Mr. LAGIMODIERE, Mr. MALOWAY and Hon. Mrs. STEFANSON having spoken,

And the Question being put on the sub-amendment. It was negatived, on division.

And the Question being put on the amendment. It was negatived, on the following division:

YEA

ALTOMARE	MALOWAY
ASAGWARA	MARCELINO
BRAR	MOSES
BUSHIE	NAYLOR
FONTAINE	REDHEAD
GERRARD	SALA
KINEW	SANDHU
LAMONT	SMITH (Point Douglas)
LAMOUREUX	WASYLIW
LATHLIN	WIEBE21
LINDSEY	

NAY

CLARKE	MARTIN
COX	MICHALESKI
CULLEN	MORLEY-LECOMTE
EICHLER	NESBITT
EWASKO	PEDERSEN
FRIESEN	PIWNIUK
GOERTZEN	REYES
GORDON	SCHULER
GUENTER	SMITH (Lagimodière)
GUILLEMARD	SMOOK
HELWER	SQUIRES
ISLEIFSON	STEFANSON
JOHNSON	TEITSMA
JOHNSTON	WHARTON
KHAN	WISHART
LAGASSÉ	WOWCHUK..... 33
LAGIMODIERE	

And the Question being put on the main motion. It was agreed to, on the following division:

YEA

CLARKE	MARTIN
COX	MICHALESKI
CULLEN	MORLEY-LECOMTE
EICHLER	NESBITT
EWASKO	PEDERSEN
FRIESEN	PIWNIUK
GOERTZEN	REYES
GORDON	SCHULER
GUENTER	SMITH (Lagimodière)
GUILLEMARD	SMOOK
HELWER	SQUIRES
ISLEIFSON	STEFANSON
JOHNSON	TEITSMA
JOHNSTON	WHARTON
KHAN	WISHART
LAGASSÉ	WOWCHUK..... 33
LAGIMODIERE	

NAY

ALTOMARE	MALOWAY
ASAGWARA	MARCELINO
BRAR	MOSES
BUSHIE	NAYLOR
FONTAINE	REDHEAD
GERRARD	SALA
KINEW	SANDHU
LAMONT	SMITH (Point Douglas)
LAMOUREUX	WASYLIW
LATHLIN	WIEBE21
LINDSEY	

The House then adjourned at 4:50 p.m. until 1:30 p.m. Monday, November 28, 2022.

Andrew MICKLEFIELD,
Deputy Speaker.